

**The Bhabha Atomic Research  
Centre Employees Co-operative  
Credit Society Limited,  
Mumbai.**

**64<sup>th</sup> Annual General**

**Meeting**  
DRAFT 64<sup>th</sup> AGM

**Date: 23/08/2025**

**Minutes**

**The Bhabha Atomic Research Centre Employees' Co-Op. Credit Society Ltd.,  
Mumbai**

**The 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting of the Board of Directors of The B.A.R.C.  
Employees' Co-operative Credit Society Ltd., Mumbai, was convened on  
Saturday, 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2025 at 2:00 PM at the DAE Convention Centre,  
Anushaktinagar.**

**Agenda of the Meeting:**

1. To read and confirm the minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Body Meeting.
2. To approve the Annual Report submitted by the Board of Directors for the period from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2024 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2025, along with the Statutory Audited Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account as on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2025.
3. To approve the appropriation of profit for the Financial Year 2024-25.
4. To ratify the excess expenditure over the approved budget for the year 2024-25 and to approve the budget presented by the Board of Directors for the Financial Year 2025-26.
5. To take note of the Audit Report for the Financial Year 2024-25 submitted by the Government Auditor.
6. To appoint the Statutory Auditor for the Financial Year 2025-26.
7. To read aloud the audit remarks for the Financial Year 2023-24 and to take note of the corresponding compliance report.
8. To approve the amendments to the Bye-laws as proposed by the Board of Directors (as per Appendix 'A').
9. To hold detailed discussions and take a decision regarding converting retired members into 'Nominal Members' as per the Society's Bye-laws.
10. To present and discuss matters related to the recruitment of a Manager and "Go Cashless" (Tatkal Banking) services.
11. To condone the absence of members who are not present at the 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Body Meeting.
12. To consider any other matter with the permission of the Chair.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I welcome all the dignitaries present at the 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting of The Bhabha Atomic Research Centre Employees' Co-operative Credit Society Ltd., Mumbai. I request all the members who are standing outside the hall to kindly come inside the auditorium.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Please arrange for one more mike.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** For the convenience of the members, kindly arrange one more mike. Thank you. I request the society's chairman Mr. Hemant Koli, to invite the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai sir, and the Vice President, Mr. Avinash Tirpude sir, to come on the dais. I also request the all board of directors, expert directors, and the special invitees present at today's Annual General Meeting Statutory Auditor Mr. Jagdish Randive, Co-operative Advisor Mr. Sandeep Patil, Internal Auditor Mr. Satish Shakya, and Legal Advisor Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar to take their seats on the dais. I also request Expert Director Mr. Arun Koli to come on the dais.

I request the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai sir, to kindly accept the chairmanship of the 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting and to inaugurate today's meeting by offering floral tributes to the portraits of great leaders and by lighting the ceremonial lamp.

I request the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai sir, to offer floral tributes to the portrait of Maharashtra's revered deity, Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj. I request the Vice President, Mr. Avinash Tirpude sir, to offer floral tributes to the portrait of Bharat Ratna Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar. I request the chairman, Mr. Hemant Koli, to offer floral tributes to the portrait of Dr. Homi Jehangir Bhabha. I request the dignitaries to light the ceremonial lamp and formally commence the programme.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you to all the dignitaries. First, I request everyone to stand for two minutes to pay homage to the members of the Society and to the departed personnel from the security and police forces, doctors, nurses, and individuals from the fields of arts, sports, literature, and social service who passed away during this financial year.

I request the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai sir, to welcome the Statutory Auditor, Mr. Jagdish Randive, by presenting a bouquet, and also to welcome Mr. Sandeep Patil with a bouquet. Thereafter, I request the Ex Officio Vice President, Mr. Avinash Tirpude, to welcome the Internal Auditor, Mr. Satish Shakya, with a bouquet. I also request the Society's chairman, Mr. Hemant Koli, to welcome the Legal Advisor, Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar, with a bouquet. Thank you.

I request Mr. Hemant Koli to welcome the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai sir, with a bouquet.

Thereafter, I request the Vice chairman, Mr. Vivek Bhagadia, to welcome the Ex Officio Vice President, Mr. Avinash Tirpude sir, with a bouquet.

I request the Ex Officio President, Mr. Girish Shenai, to deliver his presidential address.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I welcome all the respected members present at this 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting of the BARC Society, including the dignitaries on the dais the Society's chairman Mr. Hemant Koli, Vice chairman Mr. Vivek Bhagadia, Treasurer Mr. Rajesh Chaudhary, the Board of Directors and all the honourable members attending this meeting. Our role in today's meeting is that of an observer, and we will make every effort to discharge this role responsibly. Therefore, I will not comment on what the Society has done right or wrong, as I am part of the establishment and it would be inappropriate for me to do so. However, I would like to mention the improvements we have been able to make. Last time, it was observed that at the eleventh hour it became difficult to provide information when questions were raised. This time, efforts have been made to address that. Similarly, the previous minutes of meetings have been uploaded on the website. I believe very few societies make their minutes available on their websites; this is an initiative we have undertaken.

Members' suggestions and queries were addressed through one or two meetings so that adjournments or meetings extending over two days could be avoided. We have just paid homage to three great leaders. However, it should not end with paying homage alone. we must imbibe their values and try to conduct ourselves accordingly. If you look at the biographies of these three great personalities, you will find that they gave great importance to time. I therefore request everyone present to value time. Please raise your questions succinctly and to the point so that we can proceed as per the agenda. I expect everyone's cooperation to move forward according to the agenda and to conduct the meeting efficiently with due regard to time. I will not speak further. Thank you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request the members seated at the back of the hall to kindly come forward and take seats in the front. I request the Society's chairman Mr. Hemant Koli, to deliver his address.

**Mr. Hemant Koli (Chairman):** Good afternoon. I welcome all respected members to the 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting. After paying humble tribute to Maharashtra's revered deity Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj, the architect of the Indian Constitution Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar, and the father of India's nuclear energy program Dr. Homi Jehangir Bhabha, I extend a warm welcome to the Society's Ex Officio President, Ex Officio Vice President, as well as the Hon. Secretary, Treasurer, the Directors present, and all esteemed members at this 64<sup>th</sup> Annual General Meeting.

First of all, I pay homage to the members, scientists, doctors, nurses, and personnel from the security and police forces who passed away during this financial year. While presenting the accounts of our Society for the report year 2024-25 before our respected shareholder members, we feel very pleased. The Society has progressed by providing leadership at various levels. In the current report year, in the presence of all of you, the Society has achieved an increased annual turnover of Rs. 198.81 crore compared to last year.

Our Board of Directors has demonstrated flexibility and commitment to keep the Society's financial condition stable. Our Society is dependent on members who are depositors and borrowers. During the report year, members' total deposits amounting to Rs. 504,37,97,764 have remained secure with the Society. Our managing committee is committed to increasing these deposits further. In the report year, to meet members' financial needs for various reasons, the Society disbursed the loan amount by Rs. 175.88 crores compared to last year, and loans totaling Rs. 1,124 crores were disbursed. We have given priority to loan recovery, and the recovery is running smoothly.

Under the Vikram Loan Protection Fund Scheme (VKSY), we have introduced Ordinary Loans, Special Loans, and Long-Term Loans. During the report year, a total of 19 members passed away. In respect of these deceased members, 30 loan cases were settled and loans amounting to Rs. 2,41,80,610 were waived during the report year. As on March 2025, the loan overdue amount is Rs. 1,51,27,586, and the overdue percentage is 0.15%. The total NPA is Rs. 3,68,948 and its proportion to total loans is 0.36%. During the report year, the net profit has been Rs. 15,60,06,904. This reflects sound financial management and increasing trust among members. This year, to make our services easier and more member friendly, we have started digital services such as SMS alerts and website services, so that members can get easy access to their account information. After taking charge, we take rightful pride that the Society's work has been carried out with complete transparency and integrity. The audit has been completed on time and our Society has received Class 'A'. From this report, it is evident that the Society's financial position is strong.

We have successfully recovered Rs. 5 crores out of the total receivable amount from Tatkal Banking. Through State Bank of India, a free CMP portal has been started to transfer members' deposits immediately into their bank accounts. Earlier, members could get loans up to Rs. 27 lakhs; this limit has been increased and loans are now being disbursed up to Rs. 50 lakhs. Under the Vikram Loan Protection Fund Scheme (VKSY), so far loans of 37 deceased members totaling Rs. 4,97,290 have been waived, which has removed the financial burden on the families and guarantors of deceased members. The Society's turnover has increased from Rs. 926 crores to Rs. 1,124 crores. The Society's investment, which was Rs. 53 crores in the 61st year, has increased to Rs. 96 crore an increase of 81.30% in the last two and a half years.

In the student felicitation programme, instead of giving different prize amounts based on marks, all students were given the same amount to ensure equality and remove disparity. By providing a partial withdrawal facility against members' subscription, we helped members save TDS. The interest rate on long term loans under the Vikram Loan Protection Scheme has been reduced from 10.35% to 9.8%. Long term loan interest is now charged on a daily reducing balance basis on the opening balance of that day. Loans up to Rs. 35 lakhs require two guarantors, and loans above Rs. 35 lakhs require three

guarantors. Office operations have been made continuous from 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., without lunch break. Office work has also been kept open on Saturdays every month, providing uninterrupted service even on holidays. Cash withdrawal of Rs. 5,000 from savings account has been started once a month.

Members whose membership ended due to retirement/resignation etc. are being honoured with an increased honour amount Rs. 500 per completed year of full membership (uniformly). Members are being provided live account information through the Society's website. Monthly services are being provided on fixed dates to members of units at BARC Tarapur, BRIT Vashi, Navi Mumbai, and RMC Parel. Out of goodwill, the unpaid dividend for FY 2021-22, 2022-23, 2023-24 amounting to Rs. 16,43,513 has been credited to members' accounts before Ganesh festival, up to 18 August 2025. An amount of Rs. 1,31,63,000 payable as sundry amount has been credited to members' bank accounts. Before Ganesh festival, interest @ 10% on members' subscription amounting to Rs. 19,44,37,161 has been credited to members' accounts. Approval was obtained from the Cooperation Commissioner for the partial withdrawal facility, helping members who otherwise had to pay TDS under Income Tax Section 194. On the occasion of the birth anniversary of Dr. Vikram Sarabhai, an extension counter of the Society was started at Vikram Sarabhai Bhavan on 12 August 2025 for members of Vikram Sarabhai Bhavan, DCSEM, DPS, NRB and Heavy Water Board. We have successfully obtained approval from the Hon. Commissioner/Registrar, Co-operative Societies, Pune, to reduce the Society's reserve ratio from 25% to 10%. Efforts are underway to provide nominal membership to members who have retired. We are committed to protecting the Society's interests and completing pending works on time. For recovery of dues from Tatkal Banking / Go Cashless, legal notice has been served through an advocate; if they fail to pay, the matter will be taken to court for recovery. Similarly, a legal notice has been served to Career Junction Placement Consultancy for recovery of amounts paid for recruitment work not carried out; if not recovered, legal action will be initiated. Due to TDS deducted by the Income Tax Department on interest received by members since FY 2020-21 (as per rules), members have faced inconvenience, for which we express regret. Human beings are gifted with intelligence, thinking power, and emotions. A person's real worth depends on what they do. Our country has a strong tradition of social commitment. We remain committed to making the Society's functioning more dynamic and efficient and to providing better service to members through our stakeholders such as investors, borrowers, well-wishers, and through the Society's employees. We are committed to contributing to strengthening the Co-operative movement. The Society's successful journey has been possible due to the cooperation and encouragement of the Board of Directors, employees, depositor members, and borrower members. We are grateful to all. Wishing everyone good health, happiness, and prosperity, I conclude my address.

**Jai Hind, Jai Maharashtra.**

A request to members: please raises questions as per the agenda; answers will be given from the dais. We had to work very hard till the last day to obtain this hall. Members are requested to maintain decorum and respect the dignitaries seated on the dais.

Since the Secretary's health is not well, instead of him, former Secretary Shri. Shivaji Hagawane, former Treasurer Shri. Shibu Singha Roy, and present vice chairman Shri. Vivek Bhagadia, and Director Shri. Santosh Dhamdhare will address the meeting. All members should take note of this. The further proceedings will be conducted by the Secretary Bahubali Chougule. Thank you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you, chairman sir. Thereafter, I request the Society's Manager Mr. R. K. More to read out some printing mistakes in the report of the 64th Annual General Meeting.

**Mr. R. K. More (Manager):** On **Page 1**, in **Subject No. 10**, a change has been made. The revised subject should be recorded as: "To present information in the house and discuss regarding Career Junction Placement, recruitment of staff, manager recruitment, and Go Cashless / Tatkal Banking." On **Page 16**, in **Point No. 20**, "Dnyanratna" (ज्ञानरत्न) in "Student Felicitation of children of honourable members" has been printed as "Dnyanrakt" (ज्ञानरक्त).

It should be read as **Dnyanratna**. On **Page 17**, in **Point No. 21**, "Astapnethun" has been printed incorrectly; it should be read as **Asthapanetun** (आस्थापनेतून). On **Page 31**, in **Point No. 21**, under "Vikram Loan Protection Scheme," where loans have been waived, it should be read as **Ordinary Loan** for "Special and General Loan." On the very last inner page, on the last page where we are honouring members, it has been mistakenly printed as "GunGaurav" (merit felicitation). Instead of "Ashok Kumar Yadav's Gun Gaurav," it should be read as "**Gaurav Sabhasadan**" (felicitation of honoured members). Thank you.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** One more correction has been missed, which I wish to point out. In the President's address printed on **Page 6**, under the Vikram Loan Protection Fund (VKSJ), it is written that 30 loan cases and the outstanding amount is **Rs. 2,41,80,000**. But on the next page, in **Point No. 11**, the amount is printed as **Rs. 2,49,00,000**. This inconsistency is there between Page 6 and Page 7, Point 11, and also the heading "Vikram Loan Protection Fund" has been recorded for reference.

**Mr. R. K. More (Manager):** Thank you, Sir. I have noted it. I had noted it earlier but forgot to mention it. On **Page 7**, in **Point No. 11**, the 30 loan cases of 19 deceased members (considering Ordinary Loan and Special Loan) should be read as **Rs. 2,41,80,610** (not Rs. 2,49,00,000). I had noted it but forgot to state it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thereafter, I am commencing the agenda of the Society's 64th Annual General Meeting.

**Agenda No. 1: To read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting.**

As per the instructions of the Society's **Ex Officio President Mr. Girish Shenai sir**, the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting were published on the Society's website on **20<sup>th</sup> January 2025**. Members were requested to submit any suggestions, objections, doubts, or changes by **15<sup>th</sup> February 2025**, and this was duly mentioned while inviting responses. Accordingly, two members submitted their suggestions, which were incorporated. Thereafter, no further objections or changes were received from any members. Hence, I request the House to read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting and to propose and second the same.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** The Secretary has just presented the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM and approval is now being sought. However, before granting approval, I wish to refer to an important issue that became "breaking news" during the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM namely the resolution concerning retired member Mr. Tarun Kumar Srivastava. Subject to the resolution recorded in the Minutes, the firmness shown by the Society's Ex Officio President Mr. Shenai and the then Ex Officio Vice President Mr. Shriram deserves appreciation. I congratulate both of them and place a resolution of appreciation before the House. This long pending matter of the past two years was resolved by including it in the AGM resolution, and the outstanding dues of Mr. Tarun Kumar Srivastava were genuinely recovered by the present Board of Directors. For this, I express my gratitude to the Ex Officio President, Ex Officio Vice President, and the entire Board for their prompt and effective action. Accordingly, I move a resolution of appreciation and state that it stands approved by the House.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you, Mr. Vairalkar. I now request the proposer and seconder.

**Resolution: Resolved that, as per the decision of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting, the Board of Directors successfully recovered the loan amount of Rs. 10,24,741/ and Rs. 1,00,000/ from the Aapulki Sabhasad Nidhi pertaining to Late Mr. Tarun Kumar Srivastava. The House hereby passes a resolution appreciating the Board of Directors.**

**Proposer: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)**

**Seconder: Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED)**

**Resolution passed unanimously.**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you. I now proceed to **Agenda No. 2.**

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** One minute, Sir. There is sufficient time for proposer and seconder under Agenda No. 1. Before proceeding further, I request the Secretary to read out page No. 109 of the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM, as a suggestion was raised earlier on that page.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Mr. Vairalkar, are you referring to your statement on page No. 8? As per the agenda, let us proceed from Item No. 1. I wish to clarify that the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM were already published on the Society's website. The present agenda item is only to read and confirm the Minutes. Any objections, if any, can be taken later with the permission of the Ex Officio President.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Secretary Sir, the agenda clearly states "to read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM." Since this is part of the agenda, there is no need to be tense. The resolution I moved was only one of appreciation.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I agree. You are a respected member and always speak in the interest of the Society. Please feel free to express your views.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Under Agenda No. 1, questions were raised earlier regarding whether the Society had appointed a Manager and what action was taken thereafter. Additionally, there was a serious lack of experience within the Board. On behalf of the House, I had requested that an experienced person be appointed as an Expert Director, as permitted under the Society's bye laws. The appointment of an Expert Director lies entirely within the authority of the Board. If the Board wishes to avoid future confusion and face the AGM smoothly, it is necessary to appoint an Expert Director who is not related to any member of the ruling panel and preferably from the opposition. I sincerely congratulate the Board for appointing an Expert Director from outside their own panel. I support this resolution fully. My intention is only to appreciate this action. Any future discussion or response on this subject is not my concern. Thank you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you, Sir. As recorded on pages 108–109 of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM Minutes, based on the request made by respected member Mr. Mukund Vairalkar, the Board appointed Mr. Arun Raghunath Koli, former Secretary, as Expert Director.

A circular regarding this appointment was issued on the Society's website and BTS for the information of all members. I once again thank Mr. Vairalkar for moving the appreciation proposal and request proposer and seconder.

**Resolution: Resolved that the Board of Directors has appointed former Secretary Mr. Arun Raghunath Koli as Expert Director. The House appreciates this decision**

**and resolves that his experience be utilised for the future progress of the Society. The resolution of appreciation for Mr. Arun Koli and the Board of Directors is passed unanimously.**

**Proposer: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)**

**Seconder: Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)**

**Resolution passed unanimously.**

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** One minute what is going on? Everyone stop. The discussion on Expert Director is getting out of hand.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Please tell me what is the agenda before us? It is to read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM. As Chairman of this meeting, I am exercising my authority. Only corrections to the Minutes, if any, should be stated. The Minutes were uploaded on 20<sup>th</sup> January and suggestions were invited for nearly four to five months. Corrections were already incorporated. I do not want any further discussion. Only tell me whether the Minutes are to be confirmed or not. No further resolutions will be entertained.

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** You had asked for proposer and seconder. There will be no further discussion. I return to Agenda No. 1. Thank you.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** During the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM, extensive discussion took place regarding the diary issue, and a committee to inquiry was appointed.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Mr. Patil, speak only about the Minutes. Are any changes required in the Minutes yes or no?

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Sir, if no further discussion is allowed, then please note that the diary issue appears in the Minutes. How can this issue be taken under Agenda No. 12?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** We are not discussing the issue. We are only confirming the Minutes.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Sir, while confirming the Minutes, they must also be approved. I am speaking in that context. Last time, approval was granted conditionally regarding the diary issue, pending payment by former Director **Mr. Shivaji Hagawane**. Since that payment has not been made, this matter has not been included. How can we approve these Minutes?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Please read the agenda: *To read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM.*

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Sir, please listen to me. I request you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As stated by the Chairman, the Minutes were posted on the Society's website from January. Members were requested to submit objections by February. If there are any objections even now, please place them on record and then propose and second the confirmation.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Please first read the rules printed on Pages 25-26 of the report. All such matters require AGM approval.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** We are confirming the Minutes. That means we are approving what was discussed earlier. If someone has objections regarding how a matter was recorded, they must be allowed to point out the discrepancy. Preventing members from speaking on differences in the Minutes is not appropriate.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** The Minutes were available on the website from January to February for objections. Now tell me only one thing are the Minutes to be confirmed or not?

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Chairman Sir, on behalf of the House, I state that we do not wish to confirm these Minutes. If the AGM is to proceed, clarification must be given; otherwise, today's meeting should be adjourned.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Sir, this will not work. If the Minutes are to be confirmed, then discussion on the resolutions recorded in them must also take place. Do not take the Minutes as per your convenience. I have been meeting Mr. Tirpude for almost three to four months. We raised questions regarding the diary report. Now you are citing rules. Therefore, we do not accept these Minutes. Whatever the House decides should prevail, because you have stated that protocol. The House is the supreme authority.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Sir, whatever happened in the last financial year is written in these Minutes, and it is written correctly. Technically, it is right. Then understand the language of the resolution and its meaning. Place that resolution in the AGM and take the opinion of the members on it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Whatever discussion took place in the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting has been written here. I request that whatever was spoken in that meeting has been placed before the members again, and the resolutions arising from it are being discussed here.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** You are saying the report was posted in February, whereas the AGM is on 23<sup>th</sup> August 2025. Whatever resolutions exist must be approved in the AGM. Whether you upload the Minutes in February, April, or May, there are bye laws and rules. Please keep that in mind. Please read page No. 43 once and allow clarification. Saying nothing is not appropriate. I understand your health is not well.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** As per the agenda, “to confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM,” we are all collectively telling you that we will not confirm them.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I feel there is a difference of opinion between the Managing Committee and the members. In my personal opinion, the discussions that took place in the 63<sup>rd</sup> AGM are very rarely reflected in such detailed Minutes.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Respecting your words, I only said that whatever was discussed in that AGM has been recorded here. Therefore, technically, this item needs to be approved and confirmed.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** We are not saying anything else.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Then please approve it and give proposer and seconder.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** But even those words have meaning.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Please listen for a minute.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** You should clearly state that the issue mentioned on Page No. 43 of the Minutes will be taken up on priority when its agenda item comes. If nothing is said and only the Minutes are confirmed, then what does it mean confirm the meeting, take a Rs. 100 coupon, and go home?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Wherever resolutions and discussions are recorded in these Minutes, when those matters come up, detailed explanations will be given at that time.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Thank you.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** We must verify whether everything spoken and discussed earlier has been fully recorded in the Minutes. That is the only issue under Agenda No. 1. Discussion on the subject itself does not fall under this agenda item. In the Minutes received from the dais, there is also a statement that before the next AGM, any report will be informed to the members.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Mr. Chougule, you said earlier that you called only certain people and answered them. Now answers must be given to everyone.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Only those members who raised objections were called, their objections were recorded, and changes were made accordingly.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** So you called only selected people?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The words are being misunderstood. As per the Chairman's permission, the Minutes were uploaded on the Society's website and a notice was put on BTS. A format was given requesting members to submit objections by the 15th. Only those members who submitted objections were called, and changes were made. Had you come forward, your objections would also have been recorded.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** But you said you called selected people and made changes.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Only those members who raised objections were called.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** What corrections were taken on this resolution? How will we know?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The action taken will be informed later.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** When will that be informed? We need to take action.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** When the relevant agenda item comes, answers will be given. I request proposer and seconder for Resolution No. 1.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** First, congratulations to the changes in the Managing Committee. Regarding Agenda No. 1, we are ready to approve it, provided Agenda No. 12 is taken immediately thereafter and the issue on Page No. 43 is discussed. If that is done, we will approve Item No. 1.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Earlier, urgent matters like the building fund were taken first. The House is supreme. If Agenda No. 12 is taken as Item No. 2, we will approve the Minutes. There are many important matters like passing the balance sheet. Please take Item No. 12 as Item No. 2.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I have heard your suggestion. Please record any objections if you have any.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** There are no objections.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Agenda No. 12 will be taken with the Chairman's permission.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** We have no objections. Let us pass the Minutes immediately. If even the Minutes are not passed, how will the meeting proceed?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** If we take Agenda No. 12 first, it will imply that the first 11 items are already passed.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** As per meeting rules, the Chairman has the authority to change the agenda order. Just change the order and approve it quickly.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I do not have much knowledge of Co-operative laws.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Sir, you stressed the importance of time. Take Agenda No. 12 first and then Item No. 1. We come once a year, submit questions, and get answers at the last moment.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Since the legal consultant is present, let us take his opinion and proceed accordingly.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Who called the Legal Advisor? Is it necessary to call him in the AGM?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** In the 63rd AGM, members themselves demanded that legal, tax consultants, and auditors be present. Accordingly, they were invited.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** We do not accept that. Take one question first.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The printed report itself states that the General Body is supreme.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Take advice from former Secretary Mr. Hagawane. There is no need for a legal consultant. The House is supreme.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Let us take the opinion of Mr. Nimbalkar.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Was it informed that experts would be brought to the House?

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** This General Body belongs to members. Outside persons should not speak, except on the subject for which they are invited.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Experts are for the committee to learn from and explain to members. If the committee itself cannot understand, depending on outsiders will not work.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** In last year's Minutes on Page 27, a request was made to invite auditors and legal advisors. Accordingly, they were invited.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** We agree, but answers must come from you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request you not to use unparliamentary language. This House is very important.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Mr. Chougule, one minute please pay attention here, pay attention only to me. Time is very important. Listen carefully: he gave you a suggestion, not a resolution. Mr. Sarang gave a suggestion; it was his suggestion. Here, resolutions are required. Did you take a resolution for this matter? Then do not waste time. There is a 14th question take Item No. 12 quickly. Why waste time? We come only once a year, we ask specific questions, and we ask the right questions. Why are you insisting on speaking so much? Why so much displeasure towards us? We always cooperate in the office, in all meetings. Then maintain at least this much respect for us.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Chairman Sir, I am D. S. Dhotre (CDM). The respected House is advising that the order of agenda items be changed certainly it may be changed. While respecting the House, first study the Co-operative law and check whether such a provision exists in the bye laws. If it exists, then immediately follow the process and, if that subject can be taken up, take it up quickly. We do not want to waste time; we can finish today's meeting today itself.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Whatever issues are raised are raised in the interest of the Society, and the House is directing you that Item No. 12 should be taken as the second item.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Chairman Sir, since some time, the question being raised is whether this fits within the law. Please note I told you earlier and I am telling you again what fits within the law. You yourselves have stated the order of authority who is higher and who is lower and you accepted what the House has approved. Then why are you saying "no" to it?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Mr. Mahajan, please remember: above this House, the Constitution of India is the highest. You cannot pass anything that is not in

accordance with the law. When we say the House is supreme, it is only within the scope of this forum; it does not mean everything is in our hands.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Chairman Sir, I am not saying otherwise. I am showing the rule book and stating what is written in our bye laws; according to that, it can be done.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** That is exactly what I am saying my request is that since an expert person is available, let us take their opinion.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** If you cannot change the order, then Item No. 1 should remain as it is, and nobody will second it. Move to the next agenda item; let Item No. 1 remain pending and take it at the end. No one in the House wishes to pass it. From the behaviour of the House, it appears there is no desire to pass Agenda No. 1. Please go to the next agenda item and keep this pending; complete the full agenda and then return to Item No. 1. That is my request.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir please listen for a minute. You are a respected member. In any AGM, whether there are items from 1 to 5 or 1 to 10 or 12, the order can change. But with the Chairman's permission, the last item "Any Other Matter" remains at the end and never comes up earlier. That is what experts say, and I am placing it before the House. Upper items can be moved up or down, but "Any Other Matter," with the Chairman's permission, remains at the end.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Yes, I did not raise that point. What I said is: the House is not in a mood to propose and second. Therefore, keep that agenda item there and move to the next one. I did not say take Item No. 12 as Item No. 1. The mood of the House appears to be that it does not want to pass that agenda item and does not want to propose or second it. Therefore, some decision has to be taken that is why I am saying this.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The same decision was also stated by the Chairman. Sir, please listen for a minute. Give proposer and seconder, and the issues within it can be taken later with the Chairman's permission.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Sir, we understood your point. One minute what is the House? About Item No. 12 do you have respect for the House or not? If you speak about the House, then tell us who is supreme in today's meeting. You say you want answers from us if we are the House, then our wish is that discussion on that matter should be done. We are repeatedly saying this here. You are not concerned about time.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The law written by Bharat Ratna Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar is the highest please remember. I placed before you that items 1 to 10 can be rearranged. Please give proposer for Item No. 1; the issues within it can be taken later.

**Mr. Suresh Kumar:** Everyone has come here to discuss the agenda and to finish the meeting quickly. Our view is also to finish the meeting quickly and complete the agenda. The entire House is requesting you to change the agenda. People feel that Agenda No. 12 contains something important. If that important matter is taken, then we can proceed with the remaining agenda. It is within your powers to change the agenda order. So once again the whole House requests you: change the agenda and take Item No. 12 first. Please take a decision, accept the wish of the House, change the agenda, and proceed. Thank you.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Thank you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Give proposer and seconder for Resolution No. 1.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Give proposer and seconder.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Chairman Sir, you want to clear Item No. 1. You are asking for proposer and seconder in favour of confirming it. I request the House: see who gives proposer and seconder for the point I am raising. We do not wish to confirm these Minutes.

**Mr. Anand Gawankar (HPD):** The Minutes of the last meeting that have been given we do not want to pass them. We do not agree.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Give proposer and seconder for Resolution No. 1.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** It does not happen like this by insisting from behind. What the House is saying the entire House is saying "no."

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** All of you raise your hands and say raise your hands if you want the order to be changed.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** See everyone wants the change. Not one or two this is the entire AGM. The whole House is speaking here. Raise your hands. Your arbitrary approach will not work here. You will have to listen.

**Mr. Anand Gawankar (HPD):** Please raise hands.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Find a way out of this. It cannot be that you are on one side and we are on the other. After the Minutes are confirmed, will you immediately take the subject we are pointing out? If you will take it immediately, then do it immediately. After confirming the Minutes, take that as the second item immediately.

**Mr. Anand Gawankar (HPD):** Secretary.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** Sir, hello. Chairman Sir, ordinary members of the public are sitting here. They know this meeting is for the public and for all members. Everyone is saying: complete one issue properly please respect that. If you continue the meeting like this, we do not want arguments now. Everyone has come giving their valuable time. Continue that subject, please Sir. Otherwise it feels like you are avoiding this issue for some reason, and our Chairman Sir cannot do that. You should respect him. Do not insist. People are asking why you are insisting. People are telling you with a majority that this subject is serious; therefore, people want that subject to be taken first.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** First, the meeting will proceed as per agenda items 1 to 11; within those, items can be taken up or down. The 12th item is “Any Other Matter” and, as per law, it can be taken only with the Chairman’s permission and only after that.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Mr. Chougule, did you come here decided that somehow the Minutes must be confirmed?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** No.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Then we all are saying we do not want to confirm the Minutes. Agenda No. 1 is over then why are you blocking it? Start the next item. We are not confirming the Minutes.

**Mr. Anand Gawankar (HPD):** Sir, I remind you: earlier, during the Madgaonkar panel period, the Building Fund utilisation was Item No. 4, but the House requested and took it up as Item No. 1 for discussion. At that time the AGM was held in the CC. These things happen. You also respect the AGM; we also respect it. During Madgaonkar’s time, and half the people here were present then, they made the Item No. 4 subject taken first. That was the Building Fund. So, when the House tells us, we are saying: take this subject second.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** I am telling the House former Secretaries are present on the dais. All these people had taken the Building Fund matter first.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, that was under “Any Other Matter.”

**Mr. Anand Gawankar (HPD):** One more reminder: while printing the Minutes, what did Madgaonkar print? That due to disturbance created by some members, discussion could not take place. That did not happen. The entire House, by majority, took the Item No. 4 matter as Item No. 1, discussed it, and rejected it by majority. I even wrote a letter to Madgaonkar, but he did not print it in the next Minutes.

**Mr. B. A. Palwe (PD):** One minute. I am B. A. Palwe. One hour has passed and you are stuck on the same topic. Why are you not taking the matter forward? Do we have work or not? Our Item No. 12 must be taken. Otherwise dissolve the meeting nothing beyond this. How much time has passed? We keep listening to the same thing. Are we getting what we came to hear? You are the Secretary, you are the Chairman do we have no other work? Our matter must be taken now. Beyond this we will not speak.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Chairman Sir, I feel we are unnecessarily stretching this. What the House wants is in Item No. 12. You said a little while ago that whatever is there in the Minutes will be taken up on priority. Just use one word: say that you confirm these Minutes, and the next subject, Item No. 2, I will discuss the diary matter from Item No. 12. That is all. It is a 10 minute matter. Let us close at least one issue and move ahead. One hour is gone.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Mr. Vairalkar, please give me two resolutions: first, that you are confirming the Minutes of the 63rd AGM; second, proposer and seconder to take up Item No. 12 earlier.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Listen, Mr. Chougule be prepared to listen. As proposer to this resolution, I give my name.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** One minute. Is this General Body meeting for the welfare of workers and investors, or is some practical deal going on here “if you do this, I will do that”? What kind of method is this? Instead of listening to the House, you are making a deal with the House?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, you are using an incorrect word. I request you.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The words are perfectly proper and clear, and the sentence is also clear. There is no mistake in it. There is not a single unparliamentary or rude word.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED): Proposer.**

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD): Seconder.**

**Agenda No. 1: To read and confirm the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting.**  
**AGM Resolution No. 1: Resolved that the Minutes of the 63<sup>rd</sup> Annual General Meeting are read and confirmed unanimously.**

**Proposer: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)**

**Secunder: Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)**

**Resolution passed unanimously.**

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Mr. Chougule, you say use good words, but do you know what words were used from here in last year's General Body? "Sit down" and "we went to fight." There are many issues. We have supported you. So take our views first. There are ordinary members here, technicians and others; we speak politely every day.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Hello, do not waste time in the meeting; otherwise the meeting will go on for five days.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** The last time we passed a resolution regarding diary tendering tell the entire House what inquiry happened on that.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Mr. Wadekar, first allow me to read the subject. I request you again speak with the Chairman's permission. With the Chairman's permission, Agenda No. 12 has been brought as Item No. 2, and I am reading it. With the Chairman's permission, regarding "Any Other Matter," if members have questions, please ask.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Hello on Page No. 13 of the Minutes, the resolution that was moved last time regarding the inquiry committee to be formed tell us what came out of that inquiry committee.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As per Page No. 13 of the Minutes of the 63rd AGM, the Ex Officio President appointed an inquiry committee. The members of that committee called the office bearers and asked for documents for the inquiry. The Society presented all those documents before the inquiry committee. After that, the committee sought a written explanation from the office bearers, which was submitted to the committee. Thereafter, the committee prepared a report and submitted it to the Ex Officio President and the Ex Officio Vice President. No copy of that report was received by the Society.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Mr. Bahubali, listen either you did not understand the basic question. In the AGM, we together formed an inquiry committee; the Chairman formed it. The committee was formed, the inquiry was conducted. If anyone was found guilty, tell the AGM. Our resolution clearly states that the diary printing tender process was done wrongly, it should be verified, and as per court/legal punishment, the Board would be held liable, and the amount spent on diary printing should be paid by the Board from their own pocket. This resolution was passed by this House. So tell us what came out of the inquiry.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I gave the same answer to your question, that the Society submitted documents and explanations to that committee.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Sir, the committee was constituted by the Chairman, so he will answer. Why are you answering here?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Because you asked me the question.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** I spoke to the Chairman. Chairman Sir, this resolution exists and inquiry was conducted inform the House what was found.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Mr. Chougule, if your health is not well, please sit. Someone capable of facing our questions should do this.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Chairman Sir, thank you. You established this committee with the approval of the House. The Ex Officio Vice President is also on this committee. I request that the Vice President clearly inform the House what the decision was, without avoiding it. We should hear it directly from the Vice President, because it is an administrative matter and has happened through administrative channels. He should answer.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Alright. I request everyone to please maintain peace and help conduct this AGM peacefully. Regarding this subject, in the previous AGM I was seated below because at that time I was not the Ex Officio Vice President. It was discussed that an investigation committee should be formed, and accordingly the Ex Officio President formed an investigation committee. The committee called for all documents related to the diary quotations sought, tenders called and questioned everyone involved in the purchase process. After three to four days of continuous effort, the committee prepared a report and submitted it to the Ex Officio President. Thereafter, it went to the Head of Administration (Director, Personnel & Administration) and was marked to the concerned section. As per the administrative procedure, investigation was carried out, and it was found that the tendering process was not properly followed. After examination, the competent authority, the Controller, decided that the tendering process was not properly carried out, and therefore show cause notices were issued to the Hon. Secretary and Treasurer. Their replies were received, examined again, and it was finally decided to issue them a warning letter, and if such mistakes are repeated, action will be taken. A letter under the signature of the Ex Officio President was also issued to the Society's Secretary and Treasurer, and the Board of Directors was instructed that in future tendering or purchase processes there should be no errors, and that documentary evidence must be maintained and the tendering process must be properly conducted. The deficiencies were pointed out, and they were instructed that all rules and conditions must be fully complied with in future. Regarding

the report that was asked for, the applications were examined and submitted to the Controller, but he stated that it is a confidential report and cannot be given to others. That was his decision, and we informed you accordingly. If you want to make further complaints, you may do so. Thank you.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Thank you, Vice President Sir. This major issue has been going on for two years, and what is the outcome only a warning letter? Warning letters employees may have received four or five.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** It is an administrative matter; the administration took the action it considered appropriate.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Everyone listen calmly. The Vice President said the tendering process was wrongly done. What we want is what facts were found in the report. What punishment they gave warning letter or anything that is their management/administrative part, not the Society's part. Our Society resolved that if mistakes are found, the money spent on diary printing must be paid back. That is our resolution and we must proceed as per our resolution. What action they took is not our concern. The inquiry found that the process was handled wrongly.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** With the permission of the Chair, I will speak, Mr. Wadekar. What you said just now is not entirely true. You said everything was wrong everything was not wrong. What Sir said is that the committee found procedural lapses.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** If you want to go into detail on what happened and what did not, I have all the proofs ready. If you want to debate, we are ready. You tell how you did it correctly and I will tell how you did it wrongly. Do not go into that. The committee was formed and the report has been stated. You have not asked for clarification on that.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** We are not giving clarification.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Then I am ready to prove it here.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Do not hold on to one point has the Society suffered loss or not?

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** Tell me how it has happened.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** I will tell you listen. You showed a diary worth Rs. 200 in reality it is a diary worth Rs. 100. You showed two bogus companies on paper how cleverly you did it. We can prove it.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Basically, a diary worth Rs. 80 was purchased at Rs. 185. I will tell you the company Mumbai's number one company, Shah Traders.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** If you were innocent, why was the diary price not lower? If you are innocent, why was the diary price not lower?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** No, Sir. The administration has taken the action it had to take.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Has the Society suffered loss or not?

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Listen administration did what it had to do. Now the AGM will do what it has to do. We will proceed as per the resolution that was passed.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Look, no uproar. Calmly what they said, the resolution was made and passed; proceed as per that. The show cause notice and what the Vice President said there is substance in it: there was a problem in the tendering process. Earlier also we said from below that the tendering process itself was bogus; therefore this committee was appointed. The process was bogus this is why the committee was formed, and the main finding is that the process was wrong and the tenders received were fake.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** Repeat the question again.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** The same topic again.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** Let me understand your question properly.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Last time also the point was that the tender process was wrong, tenders were created, and the other tenders were fake. Discussion happened on that and the committee was formed.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** The process was not wrong.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** A resolution was passed and based on that the committee was constituted. Now you have received the outcome show cause notice where it has been decided that there were problems found in the tender process. Now proceed as per the resolution passed.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** There were procedural mistakes in the tender process that is what Sir also said.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Then did the Society benefit? I ask. Could you not have done it properly? Listen, Mr. Ghorpade are you saying all members did this? Who did the tendering process? We found it bogus and exposed it. It took one year, and the Vice President himself said about the tendering process.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** The report clearly states that the tendering process was faulty. The resolution passed was that the money spent on printing should be paid back.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadia:** Read the full report, Sir read it fully.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** The resolution states that, after verifying that wrong tendering was done in the diary printing tender process, and as per punishment through court/legal proceedings, the Board will be held liable, and the amount spent on diary printing shall be paid by the Board from their own pocket. This resolution was passed by this House.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** With the Chairman's permission, I would like to guide the House briefly. In the resolution that was read out, it is clearly written that the report prepared by the establishment was not received by the Society. Since no report was received by the Society, only "procedural lapses" were communicated. When the resolution was passed, it was clearly written about court/legal proceedings. Therefore, if the House has objections on this subject and wants to proceed with further action, it should proceed accordingly.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Director Sir, you are stating completely incorrect things.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** You are stating incorrect things. Do not divert the topic from the resolution. Read it again: "as per the punishment through court/legal proceedings, the Board will be held liable." That means they will be punished through court/legal proceedings, and the unnecessary expenditure of Rs. 36 lakhs incurred by the Society must be repaid. It is mentioned here. Read it.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** I will say only one thing. The words *court and legal* proceedings have been mentioned here. The Annual General Body passes resolutions, and from here even the Managing Committee has authority. The Managing Committee has unanimously decided that the resolution you have given is invalid. If you feel otherwise, then you may approach the court. Whatever decision comes thereafter will be acceptable to the Managing Committee.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** You are sending us to court. Your arbitrariness will not work.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Your arbitrariness will not work. You are pushing us towards court.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** This is not arbitrariness. It is the Annual General Body, Mr. Kalke.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Chairman, when the resolution was passed, you approved it. Even now you said that the resolution was approved. We are proceeding strictly as per the resolution. That is why, if you are found guilty, you will certainly face punishment through legal proceedings, and you will also have to repay the money.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** The minutes of the house were approved, which means the resolution stands approved. Please remember this.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Sir, please listen to me for a minute. This does not suit your personality. I know you well. As per my knowledge, you had even opposed the diary process in the Management Committee because it did not suit your personality. I know you well. Do not bring court language here. Whatever has been decided discuss only about repayment of money.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** I will respond to that. Mr. Parab mentioned something. Last year, when questions were raised on the diary issue, Mr. Wadekar had asked, and I myself had clearly stated that I had opposed it. That is correct. But wherever something improper happens, I consider it my duty to speak. Even now, the way improper things are happening here.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Do not give speeches. This is not the procedure.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** You have no right to spend our money for your mistakes.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Sir, once a resolution is passed, can it be cancelled? Can the committee reject a resolution after it is passed? Please tell us.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** I will speak on that subject, sir.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Our minutes have been approved.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** You have spoken now, I have understood your question. Please allow me to answer. Last year also, the first agenda item was confirmation of minutes. During that discussion, when the diary issue was discussed and commented upon, the minutes were confirmed. After consulting Co-operative experts, I understood that once a resolution is passed, another resolution on the same matter cannot be taken within it. Legally, it is not valid. Therefore, the resolution passed in today's AGM is also not legally valid, and court proceedings cannot be initiated in that manner.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Then the resolution should not have been included in the minutes.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Listen, where have we changed anything in the minutes?

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** You approved the minutes, right? Then why did you include this resolution in the minutes if you knew the law?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** The resolution included in the minutes reflects the discussions that took place in the AGM.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Can a resolution be cancelled after minutes are approved?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** There is no change in the minutes. The resolution read out today is exactly as it is, without a single word changed.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Chairman, please allow me to speak. I agree with the points raised by Mr. Wadekar and Mr. Kalke regarding the diary issue. But I request permission to approach the court, and if it is proved there, then action can be taken.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** This will be a waste of time.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** An inquiry committee has already given its result. The committee found these people guilty. Therefore, this resolution must be implemented accordingly.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The meeting is under the chairmanship of the Chairman. The statements about going to court are they made with the consent of the Chairman? Does the Chairman approve sending our own members to court?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** As I said in my opening speech, we are Ex Officio President and Vice President. We represent the establishment. We are neither on your side nor on theirs. We are neutral. A General Body is not above the law. The Constitution of India is supreme. Therefore, I will not give any opinion on this. This is for both sides to decide. We are observers and will not react.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Then I put forth another view. You said notices were issued, explanations were sought, and matters were placed before the house. If members are found guilty, the bye laws clearly state that if a member causes loss to the society or damages its reputation, their membership can be cancelled by the AGM. Therefore, as per bye laws, their membership and posts should be cancelled.

**Mr. Santosh K. B. (CDM):** As per the decision of the last AGM, a committee form, committee report, the problem of AGM proposal should be kept confidential, it has been mentioned that this proposal cannot be made, the second question is that the decision of the committee should come. Whatever decisions are being taken in the Personnel Department, they have nothing to do with the AGM because BARC or its Board of Directors has no connection with the Personnel Division in the case of Cooperative Credit Society or they have to work as per the orders of the Controller Sir. We have taken a decision regarding the committee report, what is the problem in presenting that committee report here? If the committee's report is out, why bother presenting it here? What confidential information is there in it that we can't hear, what is it that we can't

hear? The committee AGM has appointed the committee report, what is the problem in giving it in the AGM, we only want the report of the committee of AGM, Whether those are imaginary or not, what is the problem in placing the report here in the assembly, what is there in it, what is confidential in it, they just want to hide the committee, they want to hide the committee, They want to hide it from the public, it is a departmental close, nothing is against the country, against the society, to present it before the general body of the society, Sir, please tell us what is the problem in presenting that report here. If there is such a problem, then tell us. You people had taken the decision in the general meeting. This report will be presented here, what is that thing that they are hiding, we cannot hear, we are not asking whether they did something at the workplace, give the report, we are saying that we had asked the question last year. A committee was formed for the subsequent report, that committee's report cannot be presented among the people elected to the committee, what is this, and you people are going to the controller for that report, You are going to the Personal Division for that report, present the selected report before the people of the general assembly, give the answer sir.

**Mr. Prakash Patil:** Last time you had assured that the committee report would be presented. It should be presented so everyone knows the process. Also, GST fraud has been committed. If GST authorities are informed, people will be arrested.

**Mr. R. V. Hatwar (MMD):** Chairman, the meeting is getting delayed.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** These people are dangerous for the society's future. Let everything come out even if it takes one hour.

**Mr. R. D. Hatwar (MMD):** "I am saying the same thing, appoint capable people to speak on this matter, because the message that is going from the top is incorrect. The members sitting here have been elected from among us, and those who are seated above tell us that they do not accept our report or our views.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** I request that the word "dangerous" used for the Managing Committee be removed.

**Mr. Santosh K. B. (CDM):** Please answer my question.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** The report has come to the administration. What action to take is the administration's responsibility.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** "Honourable sir, in the report you mentioned, you admitted that there were irregularities in the tendering process. We called two individuals and issued them show-cause notices. You say that the House or the members of the institution have no role agreed. But sir, based on what you said, I would like to point something out. There is a rule, if a member causes loss to the institution or brings disrepute to it, I am speaking in clear and calm language, if it is stated in the report that the institution has suffered a loss, which you just admitted, then that member's membership is liable to be terminated. This right is written and applies to everyone. We are informing you of this. Now you say that this cannot be shown, as if it were something

like BARC papers, where disclosure would harm the nation. We accept the decision you mentioned, but as per the rules and by-laws, their membership should be cancelled and they should be removed from their posts. This is our request. Please act according to the law. Neither you nor I are above the law. You cannot say the law is not supreme and that what we say is greater. What can we do otherwise?"

**Mr. Rajesh Shirgaonkar (ROD):** "Honourable sir, I Rajesh Shirgaonkar speaking. The Board of Directors simply said that for this matter, we should go to court. This is a complete insult to the House. If the House says action should be taken against them, and if we have to go to court for every issue, then why hold meetings at all? Why attend meetings? Should we take every single matter to court? Will you run things arbitrarily according to your own will, and then when the time comes for action, just say 'Go to court'? Then what is the need for this House? What is the need for the AGM? If you are not going to listen or accept what is decided here, and in the end, even after allegations are proven, you still say 'Go to court,' then what is the point of holding an AGM at all?"

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** No, whether the allegations have been proven or not will be decided by the administration. That is the administration's decision.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Vice President, sir had earlier said that in this diary matter, only the Secretary and the Treasurer were found guilty, according to their report. However, in my view, the entire Board of Directors, which is a 15-member body should be held responsible for this matter. That is my clear and personal opinion. You may place it on record or not that is up to you. In any procedure, the entire committee is consulted. Monthly meetings are held, resolutions are passed in those meetings, and those resolutions have proposers and seconders. After that comes the tendering process. Even if they have admitted that the tendering process was not properly followed that the tender was not given to the newspaper or that three quotations were not invited, they have accepted this. But my main point is this, why have only the Secretary and the Treasurer been held guilty by the Chairperson? In my clear opinion, the entire 15 member Managing Committee should be held responsible in this case.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** No, whether someone has been declared guilty or not is a conclusion you are drawing yourself. The matter has gone through the administrative process as per the established procedure.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Sir, you yourself said that there was a mistake in the tendering process.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotare (CDM):** You said that only the Treasurer and the Secretary are guilty and that notices were sent only to them. But according to the by-laws, the Chairman, Vice Chairman, Secretary, and Treasurer are the first four responsible persons, followed by the rest of the Board of Directors."

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** Here, the Ex-Officio Chairman and I, as Vice President, are neutral. It is true that there were lapses in the tendering

process. However, whether someone is guilty or not is a matter to be decided by the administration.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Notices were issued to those two persons, sir. And what exactly are the lapses? Mr. K. B. Santosh asked that the committee should present those lapses before the House. Once the lapses are placed before us, we will be able to take an appropriate decision. And in this entire process, why were only those two held guilty? If the Chairman and Vice Chairman were involved, then why are they not guilty?"

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** The decision has been taken by the Board of Directors. The Secretary and Treasurer are important positions.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDA):** Then are the Chairman and Vice Chairman not important? Why not? The Chairman is the most important office bearer he is the main authority. The Vice Chairman steps in when the Chairman is absent.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SRD):** Honourable Chairperson, regarding this diary issue was the decision taken only by Shivaji Hagawane and the Treasurer? There are 15 directors sitting there. Were they not all aware?

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** If you conduct an internal inquiry and look at the voucher process first the Treasurer, then the accounting section sign. But in some vouchers, you will not find their signatures; instead, the Chairman's signature is there and the vouchers have been passed. You can check this. Everyone has the right to see the vouchers. You say you are all alert — but how many of you have actually examined the vouchers? Some of us went and checked; did the others go or not? There is an Investigation Committee then why has that committee become biased?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Sir, we have repeatedly asked for vouchers and bills every time. They are not given. We have written letters, and for two to four months there is no reply. How are we supposed to understand this? Whatever happens, the entire committee is responsible. For both good and bad outcomes, no single person is solely responsible everyone is responsible. The important thing is that the institution has suffered a loss. Rather than focusing on who is responsible, the fact is that due to the committee's actions, there has been irregularity. All the money must be recovered. We are going to pass such a resolution now you decide what to do.

**Mr. Suresh Kumar:** Honourable sir, in the last AGM we had taken a decision that whoever is responsible should repay the money.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** The Chairman is present, the honourable President of the society, please answer. Sometimes the Vice Chairman gets up, sometimes someone from the side speaks, members are interrupted. People speak after taking permission. Chairman sir, please respond.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** The main issue is being diverted. The issue is this the loss that has occurred, within how many days will it be recovered? We want them to admit this."

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** Mr. Wadekar, first of all, the institution has not yet received the report. Secondly, you asked a question I am answering.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** I have a suggestion. One person speaks for two minutes, then another speaks for two minutes everyone is putting forward their opinion. Please do not do this. Let one person stand, answer properly. If you are tired, you may sit down.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** Sir, what is your problem? I am answering the question. Please remember, this is a meeting of the institution."

**Mr. B. A. Palwe (PD):** Please listen to me for one minute. Whenever we ask questions, at that time your health is not fine.

**Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** No problem, no problem. Please control your anger a little. Sir, this is the Annual General Meeting. Please keep your anger under control. Mr. Wadekar asked how much loss the institution has suffered. I have clearly stated earlier that the institution has not yet received that report.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Then why were notices issued?"

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** Clarifications were sought from the two office bearers. As office bearers, those two directors the former Secretary and the Treasurer submitted their written explanation to the committee.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Mr. Chougule, sir just said a little while ago that we gave them a warning. A warning for what? For doing something wrong. Please keep that in mind.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** You are misleading the House. The report has not been officially received by the institution. When a copy of the report went to the committee, it was informed to the Board of Directors regarding what action needed to be taken. But where is it proven in that report that the directors caused financial loss to the institution?

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** What are you saying? Please listen calmly, sir. Don't get heated.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule:** Sorry, sir, my voice rose.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** When sitting here, one should sit with an ice slab on the head completely calm.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule:** Agreed, sir.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** The report has not yet come to you yourself are saying that. Now my question is to the Ex-Officio Vice President. We have been discussing this same issue for so long. If there were irregularities in the transaction and they have been proven and that is why two people were issued show-cause notices then I want to ask:

has the investigation process been fully completed? If the process is complete, then since our society functions under the authority and rules of the Government of Maharashtra, we accept and respect those rules. We also understand that our department has a very prestigious name, and we do not want any stain on it. But if there is nothing in this matter, then why are we wasting so much time? Please clearly state whether the transaction was irregular or not. Since show-cause notices were given to two people, there must be some basis. In your monthly meetings, you must have data — we have not seen it. How many voted in favor of the resolution and how many opposed it? That should be clear. Since you are in authority, please clarify this and give a clear answer to this House whether the investigation is complete and what legal action, based on government advice, will be taken against the Board of Directors. Just give us that assurance and close the matter. We are eagerly waiting to hear just a few clear words from you. Please say it and close the issue. Thank you.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Mr. Mukund Vairalkar has asked for an assurance regarding action but we need to know within what time frame action will be taken. That is the answer we want. Secondly, Mr. Chougule has repeatedly used one phrase since earlier that the report is with the Vice President but has not come to the institution. Please tell me, sir you are the Vice President of the institution, even if ex-officio, that position belongs to the institution. Or does it belong to BARC? If the report is with the Ex-Officio Vice President, does that not mean it is with the institution? Then why has Mr. Chougule repeatedly said that the institution has not received it? This creates confusion and gives the impression that decisions are being delayed deliberately. If the Ex-Officio Vice President has it, that means the institution has it. Otherwise, are you saying that the Vice President is not considered part of the institution?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** when a document is officially received and entered into the inward register of the society, only then does it become an official copy of the society. Has it been inwarded and recorded in the institution's register?

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD): (FRD):** Let me speak. The document came to the society Vice President, and you say that unless it is inwarded, it is not considered received by the institution. Then the committee has made a serious mistake by not inwarding it and instead giving it only to the Vice President.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** If the document is recorded in the society's inward register, only then does it become the society's official copy.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD): (FRD):** You are saying that the committee gave the report to the Vice President among themselves without informing the society. We are doing official work here. As per rules, when a document reaches an office, it is considered officially received only when it is inwarded and recorded. If it is not inwarded, it is not treated as officially received. Our management formed a committee so that the society runs properly and that the matter is resolved correctly. We respected that committee. But now you are saying that such an important committee, formed from selected and respected members of our society, submitted its report directly to the Vice President without following official procedure. That is what you are saying, not me.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** The concerned committee submitted its report to the Ex-Officio President and Vice President, who had constituted the committee.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD): (FRD):** If the report was given to the Ex-Officio Vice President, and he is part of the institution, then either you are implying that the regular process was bypassed and it was given to him confidentially without inwardsing it or, if you accept that he is part of the institution, then giving it to him means the institution has received it.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Why is the Ex-Officio President keeping the report with himself? Let him declare it. Is there some bigger irregularity involved? Why is he afraid to disclose it? Is the report being hidden? This is our cooperative society it is autonomous and it is our right to see that report. You are keeping it with you. What information does it contain? The investigation did not take much time, but preparing the report took one year. A ₹70,000 crore irrigation scam report can come in six months, but for ₹35 lakh you take one year and still you are not showing it. What is in that report?"

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SRD):** And who instructed that report to be prepared? The general body did not ask for it in front of us.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** So you are not even showing it to the owners themselves?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** Mr. Kalke, our society functions within the parent establishment, and through that establishment, two senior officers are appointed as administrators in our credit society.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Shouldn't they show the report then?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** I am telling you the same thing. The committee that was appointed by the Honourable Chairman its report will naturally go to the Honourable Chairman. Based on that, the Chairman and Vice Chairman sought clarification regarding the matter, and that clarification was submitted by the two office bearers of the institution. Now Mr. Wadekar is saying that there has been such a huge loss and that the amount should be recovered. But there are two aspects — first, has there actually been any financial misappropriation? Mr. Wadekar, how are you concluding that there has been such a loss?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** On paper, two bogus companies were created

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** The committee will state that.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** There should have been three valid tenders please listen fully. Now you are again repeating the same thing. Let me speak.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule:** You already spoken here.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** What did you just say? Now let me speak. Allow me to explain how the loss occurred.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Honorary Secretary):** Sir, this is the committee's decision.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SRD):** Sir, you asked Mr. Wadekar a question, didn't you?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Secretary sir, it's not just about the diary issue. We have a bag full of evidence. There are many other matters. Don't force us to bring them out. Let the diary matter remain limited to the diary.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The topic is getting diverted.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** You are the one diverting it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The committee has given that report; it is with the establishment (administration).

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Sir, when you were campaigning, you kept blaming the previous committee and made our heads spin. We weren't like this you made us alert. Since we were told such things happen in the society, we too have "Ali Baba's treasure bag" full of material. So take some direct decision on this.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Look, Mr. Chougule, you are talking about how the AGM was conducted and what happened, etc. We had fully presented everything in the last AGM, including the accounts. About how tendering is done I may not be the right person to explain now. But the first point is: in tendering, valid tenders are the primary requirement. The tenders received must be valid. They were not valid this is where the problem started. And it is your responsibility to verify whether they are valid or not.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I am speaking about the committee report.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Listen you said the committee report went directly to the Vice President (Ex Officio). Earlier around 15 days ago I had raised questions and you replied that this matter would be taken up and discussed in the general meeting. Now I say: generally, the process you described i.e., unless inward entry is done it is not official still, the committee gave the report directly to the Vice President. As per your written reply, you are bound to answer, who exactly appointed the committee? Who were the committee members? Did they have experience in the Co-operative sector? Did they know how procurement is done in cooperatives? If they were management people, did they have experience of purchasing worth ₹30-35 lakhs? Was the report prepared by that committee truly proper? How did the committee work what was their method? I had sent all these questions. As per your letter, you must answer today. Who was the chairman of that committee? How many meetings were held? How much expense occurred travel, allowances, etc.? If the report has come and you are saying action has been taken, and if everything is clear, then why is there a problem in presenting the report before the house? Give convenient answers. If needed, I will give these questions again along with your replies and you should answer each one clearly.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** About 100 questions were sent, but only about five have been answered properly. Please respect this issue, sir.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** That committee was appointed by the establishment (administration). Therefore: There was no Co-operative expert in it. Since it was appointed by the establishment, we do not know how many meetings they held. We do not know whether any honorarium was paid to the members. Most likely, the society has not paid any honorarium to that committee.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The committee was fully made by the management, and the report was given to the Ex Officio Vice President, which you have accepted. The Ex Officio Vice President is also our representative and part of the executive setup. If it's wrong, say it's wrong. The committee clearly informed you that mistakes happened in the tendering process. The house has been saying for long: mistake happened, loss occurred, it should be recovered so why are you avoiding it? The Chairman should give a decision on this.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Hello Mr. Mahajan. The issue is we are bound by the order given by the Controller, BARC. Please maintain silence. By creating only confusion, we cannot take the meeting forward. The solution is: if you want the report, you can submit a representation to the Controller. Or if you want to complain, further go wherever you want (Registrar, etc.). You are fully free. Now please take the next agenda points and move ahead. Don't stop the meeting here; otherwise, it will become 12 midnight and still the meeting will not end.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** So you mean to say the people whom you found guilty

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** I have not said that anyone has been declared guilty. There is an administrative procedure that has to be followed. Even if there is a lapse — suppose there was some irregularity or misconduct for example, in an LTC claim, if someone uses an incorrect procedure or submits false tickets, the first step is to issue a show-cause notice, giving the person an opportunity to present their side. We do not punish anyone without first hearing their explanation. After taking into consideration the reply given by the society members the Treasurer and the Honorary Secretary the decision has been taken by the Hon. Controller, BARC, and the matter is now closed. If you want to make any further representation, you are free to do so."

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** By giving such replies as management, you are pressurizing me.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** There is no question of pressurizing.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Let me speak. Your voice increased and your tone has changed. We are members; we can ask questions. If you had decided clearly, my points would have been answered in five minutes. You said the Controller will take action fine, we accept. But last year, as per the minutes, a resolution was passed: whoever is found guilty, the executive / full board will recover the money from them. Then why are you imposing decisions and not even listening to the house?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** I stated the management's decision.

**Mr. Shabir Alam (FTD):** *(Hindi)* : Sir, about the diary matter the inquiry process is not impartial. Why are only two people in the dock? Was only two people involved in tendering or the whole committee? Then why is the inquiry limited to only two? Why not others?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude:** *(Hindi)* Shabir ji, the head of the house is questioned first. The rest are board of director members...

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** *(Hindi)* In informal discussions, you assured (and you were present) that the report would be uploaded on the website. What happened? Please tell the house.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Sir had admitted it those who were present, raise hands he had said some part would be put on the website.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** But even sir is not above the Controller.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Then what exactly is in the report why is it being hidden?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** It's not about hiding.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** But our owners (members) are suffering 20,000 people's hard earned money.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Decision has been given by the authority.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** We are not satisfied with your decision.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** If you are not satisfied, you may go ahead take it further.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Then what inquiry did you do?

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** Sir, I feel you have given the decision and issued notices. As a matter of moral responsibility, all 12 people should resign.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** That is a separate issue. Decide what you want. Where is "moral" in this?

**Mr. Santosh Kamble (BARC Hospital):** But a scam happened, right?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Whether a scam happened or not you are deciding yourself by repeatedly using the word "scam."

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** Sir, first you said the President and Vice President are neutral. If last AGM has already passed a resolution and the quorum is ready even now

that re inquiry should happen, and if you say the report is confidential actually this is a Co-operative credit society and the AGM is held so the public/members know what is going on. There should be nothing “confidential.” Everyone wants the report to be presented before all, and a committee decision should be taken many questions are coming but answers are not.

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** *(Hindi)* We members have waited one year. Something should come out. Even with good officers in BARC, something should come out. How will we trust going forward? Form a committee from members and recover money within a month.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** With the permission of the Chair and the house, I again request the Vice President: If there is a confidential report and the inquiry has concluded, then today the house passes a resolution that through the Ex Officio Vice President, a copy of this resolution be given to the Controller and within 15 days or one month (as you decide) the report should be provided to the house.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** There is no need to route it through us. You can do it yourselves. If you want a resolution and the house passes it, we cannot say yes or no to it. Do what you want, but don't involve us. We are neutral.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Thank you, sir.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** We are neutral

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** I present a resolution on behalf of the house: In today's 64th AGM, it is resolved that the copy of the report submitted to the administration in the diary matter should be submitted to the Controller by the Ex Officio Vice President as an AGM request, and the copy should be shown/provided to this house. This resolution is unanimously approved by raising hands.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I already told you this resolution is not acceptable to the two of us. If you want to do it, do it. President and Vice President will not be involved.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Sir, I am not asking you personally. You are fully from the administration. The house has approved the resolution by raising hands. After the copy comes, the house will decide what to do. For now, at least the matter will stop here. Please accept that since you are administrative officers and also office bearers of the society, the house can place this resolution with you not with anyone else.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Ask for it, okay. Do whatever you want. But you can directly approach the Controller; no need to go through us.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** No, sir you are appointed by the administration here. Hence this resolution should go through you; I request that.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** Chairman sir, you yourself just said that you should pass a resolution. A little while ago, you said that you should pass a resolution.

**Mr. Girish Shenoy (Ex-Officio Chairman):** I am not speaking about any resolution at all.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Until the inquiry report comes, the meeting should be adjourned. Our interest is only in that report because the society has suffered loss. Let the report come; then hold the meeting again. Otherwise we will have to approach government investigation authorities. You have committed an offence by showing bogus companies knowingly. You cannot be called innocent.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Should the meeting continue or be stopped? Please decide and tell us, Ex Officio President and Vice President. We have spent two and a half hours on one topic and it is not moving forward.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Let a decision happen first; then go. The meeting is not dissolved. Please.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** The society's President started the meeting; let it end through him. Please sit.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Please nobody try to leave. The meeting will be adjourned; as decided, the Chairman will inform. Don't go.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** The meeting will not be adjourned in any manner. The meeting continues. Whoever wants to stay may stay, and whoever can help the decision-making process may do so. Thank you.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** If Agenda No. 12 is done, we will go back to item no. 2.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Chairman, the entire house requests: please present the report you prepared before the house so that a way forward emerges and we can move to next items. If the house is satisfied after seeing the report, it will accept it; if not, the house will be ready to go further. Without seeing the report, members cannot even approach the Registrar properly. Therefore, please show the report, and I request everyone to stay seated. If people leave, everything will get approved because attendance is marked and coupons are taken. So nobody should leave.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you Mr. Mane. I repeat the report has not been received by the society.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** What efforts did you make to obtain the report? Did you write letters?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** If the Hon. Controller permits and the report is received by the society, then it will be given to members.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Mr. Chougule, 1.5 to 2 months ago I gave you a letter asking whether an inquiry committee was appointed, whether the report came, and if not, what documentary steps you took to obtain it. I have not received any reply.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** At that time I had said the report is not available in the society.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I asked for a written reply. You did not reply for so many days.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I could not give a written reply regretfully. But I said then that the report is not available in the society. The committee made the report; we did not approach that committee. When the report comes, we will inform.

**Mr. Pravin Sawant (CDM):** I request the Ex Officio President: please publicly explain the duties and responsibilities of the Ex Officio President and Vice President. Do not remain only in the "observer" role. Earlier Ex Officio Presidents handled the meeting and did not say "I'm just an observer." Earlier, Mr. Kharpate as Ex Officio President had directed that the board should repay ₹30,000 in a wrong transaction, respecting the house. Don't avoid responsibility. It is your duty to respect the decision of the AGM. Don't tell members to go to court members cannot spend personally. The society belongs to all; losses affect everyone. You should direct the board to take responsibility for the loss. Please declare a decision here.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Mr. Sawant, thank you. I tried to discharge some responsibility. We formed the committee respecting the house; they submitted a report. Where and to whom they submitted it I will not get into that because it is not my responsibility. After the report came, the Controller decided it should not be shared, and I must respect that, because we are appointed by the establishment and not elected. So I repeat, I will remain neutral. What Mr. Kharpate did I cannot comment because I was not there. But I know what I must do. No matter who says what or how much pressure comes, I will remain neutral because I am answerable to the establishment, not to you. I am not an elected office bearer. I will respond to the establishment. I respect your opinion, but ultimately, I will decide my course as per my appointment.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Thank you sir, we respect you. But in last AGM you committed that a committee would be formed and the report would be presented. Even before AGM we requested the report. If you were not going to give it, you should have told us so that we could approach the Controller earlier. Now: committee appointed, show cause notices issued, mistake accepted, but report not given what should we do? Therefore we say: till report comes, adjourn the meeting and tell the Controller that the AGM wants the report.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** If the report was in favour of the board, you would have declared it easily. Now it is not favourable, so you are delaying. For four months we were coming; there was no time. When we went to Mr. Tirpude, he said why are you troubling us. Where should we go BARC Director or Chairman for such a basic matter? If the report is with you even now, read it out to the people.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Sir, if you cannot show the full report, at least display the show cause notice and warning letter. Let people see step by step first what is written in show cause, then warning letter. We are members; we will take the report later.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** *(Hindi)* The Chairman is available, right? If the Chairman is available, why is he not speaking? Why are you speaking repeatedly and confusing people? Call the Chairman to speak.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** I respect your words.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Honourable Chairman, please I request you. Our society's Chairman, Mr. Koli, is available here. Why is he not speaking? Why is he not able to speak? At least let him say something.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** I respect your words.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Sir, you are still going around in circles. You are making everything come out from the public; I am not misleading you.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** I am again saying I have not said anything like that.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Sir, I asked a question please answer: how should the meeting proceed?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** How the meeting should proceed is for the house to decide, not me.

**Mr. Prakash Patil:** You are the Ex Officio President; we are following your directions with respect.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke:** Who issued the invitation for the meeting? Who put the protocol in the report? You did. How to run the meeting and when to stop it is in your hands. That is why you were chosen.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** The establishment has entrusted you with such a high and responsible position. Therefore, we will place our complaint before you.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDA):** Then whom should we approach?

**Mr. Girish Shenoy (Ex-Officio Chairman):** If you are waiting for this report, then you may submit a representation.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Not a representation we are placing a resolution, until the report is received, adjourn this meeting.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** That is the right of the house; it is not my right.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** We are saying this: at the next date, present the report to us. Then we will take quick decisions and continue the meeting. The resolution says: let us adjourn today's meeting here itself. You tell us how many days you need; we will wait.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I cannot say how many days it will take. I will not say anything. If you want to pass a resolution, pass it.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** The house wants that report, that is what the house is asking.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** There will be **no commitment from my side right now.**

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Hold the meeting after Ganpati is over. Only four days are left for Ganpati; people have to shop, go to their village, book tickets. They called this meeting at the last moment. Let us see off Ganpati peacefully; by then the report will come. Then we can hold the meeting again.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** I agree with sir's view. Vice President sir one minute don't hold members' words against them. We tolerate unnecessary words here. Do you have the recording of last AGM? "Keep quiet!" we didn't say anything. Even now we are not saying anything, so don't suppress every word. Sometimes wrong words happen.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Chairman, if there is any difficulty, or if you want to discuss something regarding this Board, or if the President/Vice President have doubts, we are giving you five minutes official time please sit and take a decision. Don't prolong this. Today becomes history. Till now two AGMs were held by this Board; both became two day AGMs this wrong precedent is being set. You will remain only for two years and then leave, but we members have to remain here. This society is of our hard earned money. This practice of only "winning elections and showing power" must stop. So I request: have a special meeting with the Board for 5-10 minutes and discuss how this issue can be solved.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Before that, I request the Chairman of the credit society to express his views on what has happened. Mr. Hemant Koli, you are the Chairman. You are accountable to the house. Please state your position. The invitation was issued with your signature. If discussion on a controversial balance sheet point is not happening because the report is not there, it implies last year's balance sheet was wrong, and even the present/future balance sheet may be wrong. Please state your view. If you don't, then something is wrong.

**Mr. Pitambar Salunkhe (A&SED):** Sir, one to one and a half hours have passed and the meeting is going in the wrong direction. The meeting should proceed as per the agenda. It is the wish of the house that decisions and discussion happen agenda wise. Bringing new "any other matter" topics repeatedly is not right those topics never end. Take topics agenda wise; if not finished in one day, continue next day. But speak as per the agenda. This is my earnest request.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Please keep silence. My view is: if the society approaches the administration saying “we need the report,” then we will try from that angle. If we receive an application from the society, we will submit the file to the Controller, BARC, and if the Controller agrees, we will provide the report.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Sir, the Board will not approach. That is why you are seated here. We request the Ex Officio President and Vice President: even if the Board approaches, they will not give it.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Let the Board approach or you may approach.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** The Secretary clearly said the report has not come before us, but show cause notices were taken from the Treasurer and Secretary. So I am saying: the AGM's view is place the report before the AGM. Commitment was made in last AGM. If you won't give the report, at least inform us and adjourn this meeting; in the next meeting tell us that permission was denied, and then we will decide further.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Adjournment will not end the matter.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** This is an ₹1100 crore institution; there is much to speak on the balance sheet. This is a small issue.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Four hours have gone on this issue. If people approach, we will submit the file to the Controller and provide if approval is granted.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** And if approval is not granted, this matter remains incomplete then what is the use? We have been corresponding for one year and received no reply. After a year, AGM comes if we cannot speak here, what is the use?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** This will set a precedent: the Board will do something and the report will be suppressed. No there must be a decision.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Tell us what decision you want.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Declare the inquiry report you have already accepted it exists.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** This is within the administration's jurisdiction.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Sir, the administration has placed you here.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Being placed here doesn't mean we have freedom to do anything.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Not “anything” to keep control. That is why the committee was appointed. The committee was appointed by you, right? After the house asked, the President appointed the committee minutes show this.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** The report came to us for examination and we submitted it.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Then you should have said at that time itself that the committee has no authority. Why waste our time?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Simple answer: if anyone approaches, we will submit the report.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** We are approaching you how long has it been?

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** I showed your request to sir.

**Mr. Prakash Patil:** Where did you say “sir said don’t give it” or “you won’t get this report”?

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The entire house is approaching you directly do you need anything more? People are physically present.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Hon. Vice President, you keep saying “approach.” The entire house raised hands and passed a resolution asking you to send it to the Controller. What more is required? Just say: “I will try and convey the house’s sentiments to the Controller.”

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** If you pass the resolution, I will convey it to him.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Then say that clearly. Will you convey the resolution to the Controller or not?

**Resolution passed:**

**It was unanimously resolved that the inquiry report regarding the premium notebook purchase matter of The BARC Employees Co-operative Credit Society Ltd. be obtained from the competent authority of the establishment and kept on the society’s records.**

**Proposer: Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)  
Secunder: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)  
Resolution unanimously approved.**

**Mr. Pravin Sawant (CDM):** Once the house passes a resolution, it is your responsibility to forward it. Give assurance.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** It is my responsibility to convey the resolution you proposed to the higher authority, i.e., to the Controller.

**Mr. Pravin Sawant (CDM):** Chairman, you should personally try to ensure the agenda is completed. Neutrality will not work now; take a role and think how the agenda can be completed.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** How to complete the agenda is in the hands of the house. Ultimately the house will give final shape to it. So instead of putting responsibility on me, share it among all; take the agenda in sequence. If one point takes 2-3 hours, it will never finish.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Chairman, now it is 5:15. You went from item 1 to item 12 without following agenda sequence. Discussion happened but nothing concluded. Security will clear the hall at 6. If the meeting is adjourned, as per Co-operative law, a fresh meeting may need to be held within a week. Thank you.

**Mr. Anil (DCSEM):** Every member has the right to speak. If someone is speaking on mic, don't rush at him, don't snatch the mic. Last year when I spoke, ten people came at me how is that right? Let everyone put their views. Are we here just to sleep?

**Mr. Pravin Sawant (CDM):** I am leaving; I propose that absence of absent members be condoned, and some gift/benefit be given to committee members / members credit some amount in their accounts as member welfare. This is my annual view.

**Resolution passed: The rules regarding utilization of the Member Welfare Fund as suggested by the Board were unanimously accepted and should be sent for information to the Hon. Cooperation Commissioner, Pune.**

**Proposer: Mr. Pravin Sawant  
 Seconder: Mr. Sachin Solase  
 Resolution unanimously approved.**

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** Agenda item 12 now brought to item 2 needs proposer and seconder, then we go to item 3.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Oh, nothing is becoming clear. Mr. Chairman of the Society, the ex-officio President and Vice President have already spoken. They have now clearly stated that this is not their responsibility, because they are not ready to say anything. They say, "We are neutral; we will not interfere in this. The Board of Directors is yours."  
 Mr. Chairman, the Board of Directors is yours. Now you must decide whether to continue the meeting or adjourn it. The only issue here is regarding the diary matter, whatever has happened in that case. Whether there were irregularities or not, who is guilty and who is not. As the Vice President just mentioned, even your secretary has said that the report

has not yet been received by you. Therefore, you too cannot take a decision yet we clearly understand this. When the report comes to you, the ex-officio President and Vice President will say what they have to say. But as the Chairman of the Society, on behalf of your entire Board of Directors, you should state that in this matter, if there is any legal issue, we will take legal advice, and whoever is found guilty will face action according to the advice of the legal advisor. Then close this issue. If your Board of Directors is ready. Mr. Koli, speak to your Board, discuss it in detail.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Mr. Koli, please come to the mic and address the house.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Before that, let me clarify this is not about cornering anyone. It is not as if the Society belongs to us.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Mr. Hemant Koli, I am still giving you five minutes. Gather your Board of Directors, speak with them, and then give your decision.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Please speak here now. What is your position?

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** I agree. We are ready to appoint a legal advisor. That's fine.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Alright, thank you. Because regarding this matter, the proposer.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Yes, but tell us the timeline, how long will it take? Otherwise, it may take another year.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** It will be done before I retire.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** What do you say, Mr. Koli?

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** That's absolutely fair. Otherwise, the same issue will remain until the next AGM. That's why I am asking you to at least give some kind of timeframe. You will be leaving.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** The Chairman is retiring in four months. After that, his responsibility will be over. Then who will answer? What will the rest of the Board of Directors say? The Chairman had given an assurance.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** He is still here ask him now.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** Mr. Kalke, one minute. A senior member like you, who has served as a director of this credit society and held such positions should not use such words.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** I have been asking them repeatedly. I'm telling you don't change the words.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** I am speaking on behalf of the committee.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Let the Chairman speak.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** We will provide you the report as soon as possible. I assure you of that. I will give it before my retirement. What more can I say?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Give us a timeline, how many months? One month? Two months? Sir, please specify the time.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** Sir is retiring in four months. Action will be taken before that.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Will it be done before that? Does the house approve?

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** He has already answered. You are interrupting in between.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** No one is interrupting. Will it be done in four months? But let him speak. He has already said what he had to say.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** You will receive the report before I retire.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** No, give it within one month.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** One month, two months, say something definite.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** And if it doesn't happen, then you will question me for not giving the report within one month.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Don't hold him to that so rigidly.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** You yourself haven't received it yet, please listen. You should state it properly, something like: I will receive it within one month, and then I will give it to you in two months, or three–four months, or even six months.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Three months will be fine.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Within four months.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Don't keep it for four months. One minute, Chairman Sir — how can it be four months? That would coincide with your retirement time. Don't keep it till retirement time. Make it three months, not four. If at all, keep it to three months.

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** Honourable Chairman, the report is ready. Why are three months needed? Honourable Chairman, does opening the report require three months? If the report is ready and with you, do you really need three months to take it forward? Let's move ahead

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** Bhagadiya-ji, the rules say that the Secretary conducts the AGM. You are speaking again and again. You should decide among yourselves, why do

you keep interrupting? Chairman Sir, the report is with you. You have to obtain it from them and place it before us. If that is the task, why are three months needed?

**Mr. Vivek Bhagadiya:** Sir has already told you, it is Sir's responsibility to ensure the report reaches the Controller. Let Sir do his work. Why are you interrupting in between?

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** You are misleading. You are going in circles. It has just been decided that he will approach, prepare the report, and place it before everyone okay. Chairman Sir, we trust you. Please say that you will get this done within two months along with them.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SRRD):** Chairman Sir, many thanks to the House. From today, within two months, where will the inquiry committee's report be presented in the House or on the institution's website?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Patil Sir, just one minute please do not put it on the website. Wait. Don't set a wrong precedent. The House should consider this carefully. Let us not, in haste, say something and handle it incorrectly.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** How will we receive that report? Chairman, you are making a commitment. After two months, how will we receive the report? In what manner will it be given?

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** With the Chairman's permission, I will speak.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** No, please let him speak. Please allow him to speak. The Chairman has made a commitment. He is the President of the institution; he has the authority. The matter has already been discussed.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Those people who have been continuously involved in the dealings will be called, and we will provide the report to them.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Within two months.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Within two months.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Please record in the minutes that you will provide the complete report as it is.

**A Member:** A humble request to the Chairman, please clearly state to everyone what decision has been taken.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Repeat it. Please repeat to the House what I just said.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Alright. After the report is received by us, we will submit it to the House within two months.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Members will be called to the institution and informed. If we are to move the meeting forward, we must follow proper procedure. The wording must be framed correctly and then taken forward properly.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Don't say something different now. Within two months after the report is received, it must be handed over to those who have pursued the matter within two months, not after that.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Please listen. I want to clarify the wording you used. The ex-officio President and Vice President have already clarified to the House that they had asked for the report but were informed by the Controller that it had not been received.

Now, as per the resolution passed by the management in this House, we will again formally request the report from the Controller, stating that a resolution has been passed asking for the report within two months. But tell me if they do not provide it, can we force them?

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** No, we cannot.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Whatever correspondence is required to obtain the report will be done. Those members who have consistently followed up on this issue will be called and informed periodically. They will be invited within two months and kept updated.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Alright, agreed. But take five members from the House with you when you go to the Controller to obtain the report. Take some experts along so the report can be obtained quickly.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Yes, that's fine.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** And appoint them right now so that no time is wasted.

**Mr. Santosh Kamble:** And Sir, what if the report is not received?

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Chairman, I have one request. Please add one more point if the report reveals fraud, then the concerned members should not be relieved until the matter is cleared.

If someone is a defaulter of two or four lakh rupees, their guarantor is held responsible. Similarly, until this matter is resolved, no member's accounts savings or otherwise should allow withdrawals. Accounts should be sealed until the matter is closed. Even if someone retires, their final settlement should not be completed until this issue is resolved.

Otherwise, tomorrow that person may leave peacefully and we will keep running around here.

Sir, I have been working for 35 years. This is the first time I have seen such a meeting where anyone stands up and keeps speaking randomly. The Chairman and Secretary

deserve respect. Meetings are conducted by them. Experts should be allowed to speak. Let us finish quickly and go home.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Let me clarify read the bye-laws. On page 31, it clearly states that conducting the Annual General Meeting before 30th September each year is the Secretary's responsibility.

What is going on here? Is this a marketplace? Anyone comes and speaks repeatedly. The bye-laws are here. Decide properly. If the Secretary is unwell, appoint one person to speak not everyone coming up again and again.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** I am responding based on what Mr. Prabhat Singh and Mr. Vilas Ghorpade have just said.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Actually, from among our members, declare the names of five people right now so there is no delay.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Those who are demanding representation should give their names. The committee will accept the names given.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SRRD):** First, I propose the name of Rajesh Kalke. If the House approves approved. Second, Satish Mahajan, D.S. Rajapure.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Manoj Wadekar.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** No, let those who are willing come forward. Why are you deciding on their behalf?

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** No, the House is deciding. The House is selecting these members: Manoj Wadekar, Satish Mahajan, Rajesh Kalke, Ravi Hankare five members.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** There has been an objection to some names. Let the House decide. If there is an objection, should we decide our own names? Please come here.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Five members will go on behalf of the committee. Let them volunteer willingly. No one should be forced. Whoever wishes to work in the committee should come to the mic and announce their name.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Take these names take 10 names of those who will participate.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Please, I request the House discuss among yourselves and give me the ten names during the meeting. We will organize those ten names accordingly.

**Mr. Kishor Pawar (Transport):** You can request names for a committee of four or five members. But now, everyone is giving every name to the House. Among the ten to twelve people speaking, most of us don't really understand what's going on. Please include my

name as well so that we know what the report contains. For each matter, specific people speak, and only those present in the House have the right to express their opinion.

So far, two and a half hours have passed just on the diary issue. There are other matters ahead. Suppose the report is simple, but five to eight hundred people are standing outside while four people speak in my words, it's chaos. I humbly withdraw my word.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** We feel insulted. We have studied the matter and are speaking. Four months have already gone for this.

**Mr. Kishor Pawar (Transport):** I withdraw my word. I did not intend to speak like that; I withdraw my word.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Did you conduct any proceedings?

**Mr. Kishor Pawar (Transport):** It is not right that these people are confronting me. I withdraw my word. I spoke in the heat of the moment, and I don't fully understand.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdare:** I request the House to remain calm. He has withdrawn his word, so don't argue further. Let us move forward with the agenda.

**Mr. S.S. Mahajan (FRD):** I request the members if you do not understand anything about cooperative or preliminary proceedings, don't waste time.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdare:** I request the House, since Mr. Dakshor Pawar has withdrawn his word, this should be removed from the proceedings.

**Mr. Kishor Pawar (Transport):** Chairman, I withdraw my word. I did not think much before speaking. I have studied thoroughly and expressed what I wanted to say honestly, expressing my feelings.

**Mr. Sanjeev Varma (RRMD):** Sanjeev Varma from RRMD.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdare:** Shall we move to the next matter, Patil Sir? I request the House please, Mahajan, take a seat.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** What is happening? Why does it take so long for these members to conduct proceedings? Those who were involved already know what to do. Everyone has the right to speak at the mic, but why does it take so long? The benefit of this process is for all members of the House. Don't divide anything everyone is our brother, no problem.

**Mr. Sanjeev Varma (RRMD):** Sanjeev Varma wants his name included as a member of the investigation committee. Please note my name.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Step back from the mic a little.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Include my name in whichever committee is formed.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** Sir, we have been waiting for four hours. Not a single point has been clarified yet. Sometimes the lower-level people are above, sometimes the upper-level people are below. After 25 years, this is the first time we have seen the diary circulated. We gladly showed it among ourselves. Earlier, under any SO/E, nothing like this happened. For the first time, we have not taken anyone's side this is the first time we are presenting such a point.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** Let him speak.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** This is what I wanted to convey, Sir. Some people have taken too much money, consumed it. Besides that, there are many points. For small amounts, you do a calculation two lakh, five lakh I am not reducing that. In four and a half hours, not a single point has been addressed. Mr. Shennai, when will we speak? We also have many points. So, if money is being deducted, it is significant. Its recognition is that the money is not deducted, and others will get stuck. That's not my point.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Prakash Patil.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** I have nothing to do with the diary.

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** I request the House to allow him to speak.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Prakash Patil, let him speak.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** Talk about the money that I have consumed. Chairman, see, I have nothing to do with the diary. Out of 8,500 people, many have circulated the diary and everyone appreciated it. My point is not about whether you made a 50 lakh or 30 lakh double entry that has nothing to do with us. But the point is, all twelve points stopped. Why do we need to come next time? Clarify this matter now. We have nothing against anyone. We are grateful for the diary, which has circulated after 25 years. If someone has an objection, then fine.

Another point: no one allowed certain points to proceed. That's not my concern. I am speaking openly. Don't shout from behind. Whose money did I take? Say it standing in front. I have been speaking for 25 years don't interrupt from behind. I have not taken anyone's money, so why speak from behind?

**Mr. Santosh Dherdere:** I request the House every member has the right to speak. Let him finish his statement. Do not interrupt the speaker. Do not create confusion. Let the members consider this.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** Even before the topic, we showed our interest. Ten days ago.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SRRD):** The diary issue is repeating itself. Now, from the names received from the House, display them. Everyone has given their names voluntarily — list them so members are informed. Now, for this diary, give the names of the five members suggested. Keep calm.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex Officio Vice President):** Ansari Ji, please keep silence.

**Mr. Sahbaz Ansari (AM&PD):** Has the whole day gone like this? What's the problem, over the diary?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Please sit down calmly. Let one person speak.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Members, sit in your seats. We request the security department to maintain order.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Members, please sit down.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare: Agenda item 3:** Approval of the annual report for 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025, and approval of the Profit & Loss Account and Balance Sheet as on 31 March 2025.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure:** Chairman, "any other matter" is not finished, so please don't go to agenda item 2. This is my earnest request.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** What to take in "any other matter" is with the Chairman's permission.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** The house must decide whether to take the remaining agenda items or keep speaking only on this.

**Mr. Prakash Patil:** Take the opinion of the house, sir.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** First point, the meeting time is from 2 to 6; now it is 5:51. We must decide whether to proceed agenda wise or continue discussion only on item 12. In my opinion, the discussion on the diary matter has happened and is concluded.

**Mr. Prakash Patil:** We just need to give formal proposer/seconded approval.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I had approved your request for the diary; I did not approve all points. Therefore, further discussion will not happen. Also time is ending take remaining agenda items; if time remains, we can discuss other points.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Dhamdhare, the names of the five persons that came from the house please tell them... ten persons' names, sorry.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** At present, the names that have come forward are: Rajesh Shelke, Prakash Patil, Ravindra Hankare, Manoj Wadekar, Satish Mahajan, Kishor Pawar, Rajan Bagwe, Mukund Vairalkar, Sanjeev Verma.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Rajan Bagwe and Sanjeev Verma are themselves willing; they have come forward on their own.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Okay, thank you. Dhananjay Dhende and once again, as per this subject: Mukund Vairalkar, Rajan Bagwe, Dhananjay Dhende, Sanjeev Verma these make ten names. Mr. Vilas Ghorpade, Mr. D. S. Dhotre.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** We had decided only ten persons' names.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** I, Mr. Mukund Vairalkar, propose (as proposer).

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Mr. Prakash Patil as the seconder from the house for this resolution, Prakash Patil.

### Resolution

**It was unanimously resolved that the following members: Mr. Rajesh Kalke, Mr. Prakash Patil, Mr. Ravi Hankare, Mr. Manoj Wadekar, Mr. Satish Mahajan, Mr. Kishor Pawar, Mr. Mukund Vairalkar, Mr. D. S. Dhotre, Mr. Sanju Verma, Mr. Dhananjay Dhende, Mr. Vilas Ghorpade, Mr. Rajan Bagwe be unanimously appointed as a committee to cooperate and provide the assistance required by the Establishment for the Society's work, as and when needed by the Board of Directors.**

**The resolution was unanimously approved.**

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Chairman, what is this decide, who will speak?

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** That's it Bahubali has fallen asleep; Santosh Dhamdhere will conduct the meeting now.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Ghorpade sir, with Chairman sir's permission, I request everyone Mr. Bahubali Chougule has not been well for the last 20–25 days. He has written to the Ex Officio President and the Vice President; after writing, he has taken their permission. About 4–5 days ago, he gave a letter stating that his surgery is on Monday. Therefore, he has appointed different persons for different parts, and we will proceed accordingly. You are saying one person should take the agenda however, the Chartered Accountant is present; he will speak on the balance sheet.

### Agenda No. 2

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere: Agenda No. 2 Acceptance and approval of the Annual Report for the period 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025 submitted by the Board of Directors, and acceptance and approval of the Statutory Audited Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account as on 31 March 2025.**

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Up to 18<sup>th</sup> August 2025, no member had submitted any written letter for this item. Therefore, I request the house to give a proposer and a seconder for this.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I have a lot to speak on this subject; I want to discuss it. I had given many questions; hence I want to speak on this.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Rajapure sir, you came to the Society and asked many questions on the balance sheet; we have given you replies.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I will speak only on the questions for which I did not get answers. On those where I got answers, I will not comment.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Sir, a request please provide a PC to Rajapure sir so the work can be done quickly.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Please, we have to move ahead with the agenda.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Please provide a PC to Rajapure sir; he will work properly from there.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** The reply given to the issue raised by Rajapure sir is completely wrong. If any member asks a question, then going to the extreme and insulting him what is this? You said "give him a PC, make him sit there." You say you have answered all his questions, but he says some answers were not given even then. In your replies to each letter, you don't really answer; you only say "this subject will be taken up for discussion." That is your standard reply to every letter. Therefore, he is asking for answers so that the house can know. Give him five minutes, finish it quickly.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Rajapure sir briefly. The Chartered Accountant will answer.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** It's not "not important." The balance sheet is wrong; I will prove it 100% it is wrong. If you are ready, there are many such issues. You have not added 0.5% amount to the Loan Protection Fund. The closing balance is 828 crore calculate 0.5% of 828 crore and see how much should have been transferred, and how much you actually transferred. I am not even talking about the opening balance. For 828 crore you should have transferred 0.5% how much did you transfer? I know the answer. If I have to give answers to every question myself, then what's the point? And in one financial year, 128 crore has been disbursed.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Rajapure sir, I understand your question. I am repeating it for the Chartered Accountant because he didn't catch it clearly. You are saying that under

the Loan Protection Fund Scheme, we transfer 0.5% to the fund, but with an outstanding of 828 crore, the expected amount was not transferred.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** For members, I will always be here; I won't go home. Rajapure sir on page 46, in the last year schedule, the opening was ₹5,25,20,105. During this financial year, ₹4,06,66,668 was added. This year we did not do any additional provision; last year's figure was due to recoveries made by the Board (Srivastav's) and there were recoveries of ₹10,00,000 and ₹24,741. At this stage the figure of Vikram Loan Protection Fund is ₹7,30,914. Now please state your query.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** In the current financial year, "received during the year" on page 46 they themselves said 4 crore 6 lakh. As per calculation it should have been 4 crore 52 lakh. Even if I extract month wise data, even taking only opening data, it comes to 4 crore 11 lakh so the provision is short. Dhotre sir has calculated it, not me. And every month we disburse 25, 20, 10 crore, and by year end an additional 175 crore was disbursed. Even taking an average of 80-90 crore, 0.5% of that becomes very big. Then how did you collect only 4 crore 6 lakh?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, I had told you this was discussed with you.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** One minute just for procedure. It is 6 o'clock. As per procedure, we should follow. You cannot do this recording. Let us extend this meeting by one hour.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you, sir.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Rajapure sir, I had told you: opening balance is ₹5.25 crore and during this year ₹4.06 crore was received. Your question was that the figure does not match. In actual working, we will again take the monthly data often recoveries don't come for many members. When we send demand suppose someone has a ₹10 lakh loan and EMI ₹10,000; sometimes only ₹5,000-₹6,000 comes. Under the Vikram Loan Protection Scheme, we transfer 0.5% based on the balance outstanding for that month. The actual fund received in that financial year is mentioned. Since this has come up, with Ex Officio President's permission, I will say: discussion is happening on the balance sheet, but remember the question is whether the balance sheet "gets generated" or is "made." Balance sheet has two sides income and expenses. On the income side, we do nothing; the balance sheet is generated automatically in the system.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** We have such costly programs. As I said, 0.5% of 828 crore is about ₹4.11 crore. You have distributed 180 crore in a year. My calculation gives ₹4.52 crore provision.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, I request you to come to the Society office.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Not in the office answer here. If a difference is found, will you prepare a new balance sheet and present it?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, this balance sheet is perfect.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** 1-2% here and there is acceptable, but I have been raising this for four years. Money hasn't gone outside; it shifts from one head to another. Last year also I said this. Last year Shri Ram sir called me personally and requested to pass the balance sheet; then it was passed in another meeting. Even today I say it because it's wrong. A difference of 50 lakhs do the opening balance calculation. Ask the auditor.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The auditor is here; we will ask him.

**Mr. Jagdish Randive (Auditor):** Thank you for your question. This is a calculation part. We have PEOCIT software; nobody can change anything in it. PEOCIT is a big company in Maharashtra. You cannot change anything in the balance sheet; the Board must formally write a letter. Even to reverse an entry, permission is required. The balance sheet comes from the system only. A system audit is pending get it done.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** We have been saying this for four years; every year we spend 10-15 lakh on the system, still the balance sheet doesn't match. Who will correct it?

**Mr. Jagdish Randive (Auditor):** That is why you must do a system audit.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Last year it was decided to do a system audit still not done.

**Mr. Jagdish Randive (Auditor):** It is necessary. It is our recommendation; we have written it in the report.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** This year too we spent ₹12.40 lakh on the system how much more? We don't get the correct audit report. Since 2020 I have been saying this.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Rajapure sir, you know we have processed the system audit. Next week the system audit will happen; people will come. Provision has been made. We first called a cooperative consultant; it became clear that system audit is compulsory. This year we have provisioned for it. Also, for legal expert/advocate, last year's minutes mentioned it. The Chartered Accountant has clearly said the balance sheet is generated by the software and cannot be changed. I request the house this has been going on for three years. Rajapure sir speaks on the balance sheet. I request him: when we work on

this balance sheet related issue, we will call you please come and work with us, so we can proceed properly.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** No, but the program is there then why does wrong come?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Randive sir said changes happen through updates and processes. We have called PEOCIT people; we will call you too. Whatever demands you have, put them before the committee this is your society. Come in the committee and speak; whatever is possible we will do. Nobody is speaking negatively. We need to move ahead.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** For three years, the same assurance: “we will form a committee,” but nothing happened.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** House, is it acceptable to include Rajapure sir in the management committee?

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Only assurances are being distributed; no actual action is taken.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Please at least keep replying to his letters.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Next year also it won't happen.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Rajapure sir, please cooperate a little from the dais.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Can you give assurance on their behalf?

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** I give assurance next week we will do system audit, and we will take him along and call him.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I don't care about the system; the figure must be perfect. It is your duty to correct it. I am a member; I find the balance sheet wrong.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** We request you to guide us as an advisor by staying with us.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** This is the third balance sheet every year VKSY provision is not proper. It is in last year's minutes too.

**Mr. Rahul Sharma (HWD):** Chairman, every year irregularity in the balance sheet comes before the house. Is it a mistake or not do you accept it or not? You hired a CA; have you ever shown us the CA's remarks? Have you ever brought their recommendations/observations before the house?

**A Respected Member:** I don't want to speak for or against anyone. It's a technical problem that neither side is clearing. The real point is: March salary is credited in April, and then the salary section deducts EMI. So even if a committee sits, figures will not tally as per their calculations. Software shows 31 March balance; recoveries don't come; so balance sheet percentage wise can never exactly match. People waste time in arguments.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** I want clarity. We take installments monthly. Conceptually it doesn't fit within a year you can't have 13 installments; you have 12. If CA has been telling for years to update system and audit it, why wasn't it done earlier?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** When CA audit included remark about system audit, we immediately initiated tender process, contacted system auditors, understood procedure, and next week they will come. In last 65 years, system audit was never done. Since 2020 it was demanded, but people didn't know; now we know and are doing it. Let us move ahead.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Mahajan sir, be mindful of time, otherwise the meeting won't happen.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Okay. Our turnover crossed 1000 crore; last year 850 crore. By 0.5% it should be around 4.06 crore.  $406 \times 200 = 812$ ; 850 should come even a 10th pass like me can calculate; why people don't understand?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Simple calculation is not how software works; come and see.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** We had 19 deceased members; we waived loans of ₹2,41,60,610 (page 6). Again we made a provision of ₹3.5 crore, and by 0.5% around ₹4.5 crore has come total around ₹7.56 crore. This provision is inflating. Average write off is 2–2.5 crore. If we hold 3 crore and you add 3.5 and incoming 4.5 makes 7 crore. If you can't give interest relief to members as per Mumbai Bank, then give relief to borrowers if it becomes 0.3%, members benefit a lot.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Actually, in last AGM discussion you suggested transferring more profit into Vikram Security Scheme. As per that, in this year's annual report we have made a slight change: from 0.5% we are reducing to 0.3% and printing it in the report; the house should approve. Earlier we said we will reduce loan interest by 0.96; we have reduced it.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** You are stating wrongly.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** We declare here: from 0.5% to 0.3%. Give proposer and seconder.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** There is still time for proposer/secondor why rushing? If later funds fall short, you already have the right to increase. Currently there is excess of 10 crore. Ghorpade, don't take proposer/secondor on balance sheet yet.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Not proposer for balance sheet proposer is only for that rule change, not for balance sheet.

### Resolution

**It was unanimously resolved that the change suggested by the Board of Directors in the rules of the Vikram Loan Protection Scheme (VKSY), reducing the rate from 0.5% to 0.3%, is unanimously accepted, and the same be forwarded to the Hon'ble Cooperative Commissioner, Cooperative Societies, Pune for information.**

**Proposer:** Mr. Sachin Solse

**Secondor:** Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM)

**Resolution unanimously approved.**

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** They are asking for it on the balance sheet.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Sir, I still have more questions.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** But the question is: why does your program do wrong in such a simple calculation, as Mahajan sir said.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, come to the Society; we will show you 100–200 accounts randomly.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I don't want 100–200; in reducing balance, the figure reduces.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** You come to the Society.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Last year also you said the same, but nothing happened.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** No, this year we will do it note this in the minutes.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Rajapure sir, come Monday; we will check 100 samples.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Second point on page 6, the NPA you showed is ₹1,51,27,586 and below again you showed ₹3,68,09,448 there is a difference. How did the NPA

increase? Secretary sir should answer. If NPA increased, how did you decide how much NPA is there?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Give me two minutes to display the file. Ghorpade, I will mention the file of how NPA process happened. Standard asset/NPA provision is as per guidelines. Total members are 18,500; their outstanding loan amount is ₹11.64 crore. Based on that, provision comes to ₹2.48 crore in standard assets. Then sub standard and doubtful assets. If we calculate Doubtful Asset 1, 2, 3, then for the 10,660 borrowers, total loan amount comes to ₹3,68,09,448 this is standard provision and accordingly we have calculated it.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** You are saying “pending” but writing “NPA.” You are saying amount is not coming, and you are showing it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** NPA means it may not be received; this is NPA provision. As per guideline, NPA is non performing asset. We keep provision. Many times a member becomes defaulter for 2–3 months, then salary resumes and it becomes standard again; so we mention it.

**Mr. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** Subscription interest you started from 11th date I asked last time. Profit is good, very good. But why don't we get 10% interest on subscription in April? Can we get it tell us.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As per prevailing practice, we give it at Ganesh festival. Last time you asked similarly. We provision in March and give at Ganpati. We will try to give earlier around April/May. Once balance sheet is final, we will give; next year we will try.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Is there a provision that when interest comes, can I keep it in a temporary deposit and earn interest for 5–6 months?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As per your suggestion, we will definitely work it out. It's a very good suggestion.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** Subscription interest should be credited in April. Today it is April, May, June, July, August you give in August. For four months you used our interest without paying.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The sooner the balance sheet is completed, the sooner it will be credited.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** We accept what the auditor says. But give in April/May/June whenever balance sheet is approved. But for the months you delay, we want that interest too.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** We discussed with the CA; he said once balance sheet is approved, we can immediately give interest in April/May.

**Mr. Dinesh Mane (PD):** We accept, but we want interest for the delay months.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** That is not possible like that, because money is rolling; you already get compound effect. Still, next year we declare: as soon as FY completes and balance sheet is passed, we will credit interest.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Is there provision to keep it temporarily as deposit for 3 or 6 months, and get interest?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** You can keep your amount in term deposit.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Is there a 3 month/6 month option? Please tell us the scheme.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** If kept in savings, you get 4% interest.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UID):** Okay, tell us the scheme.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Secretary sir, the NPA figure you are stating seems a mistake. Our NPA is not that much. Why are you doing provision?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As per standard asset guidelines, provision must be made.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Standard okay, but NPA is not that much.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Do you want percentages? Here percentages are entered asset wise.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** As per our bye laws, subscription interest can be given only after balance sheet is passed. If you want it in April, bye law changes will be needed. After passing, we will try to give as early as possible.

**Mr. Dilip Rane (CDM):** Page 11 Member Future Assistance Fund bonus ₹14,49,153 but for 10 years we haven't received this bonus.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagawane:** For 10 years it hasn't been credited. With Chairman's permission, this scheme started during Koli sir's time. In the old software the file

crashed; data has now been fully recovered. After recovery, we will try to give bonus as per method this year, including to retired members. Like we traced unpaid dividend and credited accounts, similarly we assure this allowance will reach every member.

**Mr. Dilip Rane (CDM):** Asked whether, if the 6% bonus had been accumulated every year, it would have grown by now.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagawane:** Confirmed that this is correct. After the data was properly consolidated, the complete details were obtained from the society. This year, the bonus is now available, including for some members and some retired members. For members who had already withdrawn, efforts were made to ensure the bonus and interest were credited to their accounts. a guarantee from the platform that the allowance/bonus would reach every member appropriately.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request the house to approve the balance sheet now.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Page 40 under liabilities, you have created separate funds: Bad Debt Fund ₹1.98 crore, and again NPA provision of about ₹2.5 crore. These look like for the same purpose. You wrote "Produced Loan NPA Provision" ₹2.5 crore, and already have old provision ₹1.98 crore.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Not two see carefully: the upper is fund; the lower is provision.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** But ultimately, it's for loans, right?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The earlier is an existing fund; this year we made provision.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Why separate heads? Put it in same fund.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagawane:** With Chairman's permission Bad Debt Fund is an old doubtful debt fund for old cases where borrower and guarantor both are deceased; for such old cases, with General Body approval, we can write off; this is that fund. NPA provision is as per cooperative department circular from last year after NPA classification, 5%, and after 180 days, 100% provision. Also, NPA is rotating if a member misses EMI for 3 months, he goes to NPA; when EMI becomes regular, he moves out and someone else enters. As per government circular and auditor remarks, we have made provision. Both heads are for different reasons.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Second question page 50. I had given letter to see vouchers; I checked and it didn't tally, so I am asking: "Outstanding liabilities for printing & stationery" ₹1,75,604. As per my knowledge, the last monthly meeting was on 28 March

and you officially closed year end. But you created vouchers dated 31 March and made provision. In 28 March meeting, these bills were not there. After closing on 28 March, how did you again make provision on 31 March? Did bills come after 28 March? Do all 15 committee members know? Because you did not show me the agenda that you circulate internally; I asked till 5:30 yesterday but you didn't show. So I again studied balance sheet and found mismatch between book figures and vouchers. Later, Chougule sir showed some bills dated 29 March, but meeting was on 28 March. Is this how it works? Do all know, or only 2-4 people do this?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** You met me yesterday evening; I asked sir also, collected all bills, but by then you had left. The bill of ₹1.75 lakh you are asking I had shown you that bill that day too.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** No sir, you did not show all bills; still not shown.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Come Monday morning; I will show all bills.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** No, but this method of working is incorrect, and I want to bring it to the notice of the house. On the **28th**, you held the meeting, closed the year, and made provisions. Then on the **31st**, you passed vouchers and made provisions again. Are the other members aware of this, and do they accept it? The agenda circulated on **28th** was known to fifteen people, but what you did later was not known to them. This is incorrect and should not happen. You added the **29th's bills** to the balance sheet were the other members aware of this? I ask the Secretary: the Secretary had clearly declared in the minutes on **28th** that 'from today I am no longer the Secretary,' which was read in the minutes. Mr. Havgane, you presented it this way in the minutes. Then the bills came on **31st** were you aware of this? Because by **31st**, there is a change in position, and as Secretary, you were officially in office. When I checked the documents, I noticed this. Sir, you will be shown the documents again at the office, but at that time, as Secretary, were you aware? I ask this because the Secretary was officially in office till 31<sup>st</sup> Were they aware?"

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, I told you those are provision bills.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Meeting on 28<sup>th</sup> March, year closed officially. Then on 29<sup>th</sup> March you took bills what hurry was there to purchase?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Come to office; I will explain.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Not alone in office...

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Technically he resigned, but these bills were for work assigned by the Society during his tenure; hence he would know.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Mr. Hagvane, you did not answer that question. I am asking you: on the **28th**, you resigned. On the **29th**, some material arrived at the society. The bills for that came to the society on **29th and 30th**. Were you aware of these bills? And you resigned because you did not sign the **minutes book**. What is the reason behind that? Why did you not sign the minutes book? The **minutes of the monthly meeting** were recorded; everything, including the collections, is in there. If you were aware, why didn't you sign? The Chairman did not sign, and the Secretary did not sign. For the **monthly meeting of 28th March**, none of the officials signed, sir. How are we supposed to proceed now, when these bills have already been passed? You acknowledge all this. The entire issue arises because of whether you conduct **transparent governance** or not but it does not appear that way.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Come Monday; I will provide all information.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Then why hold General Body? Call us to office all year.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Rajapure sir, come Monday.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Come Monday; we will check files and minutes.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** My question: did Hagawane sir see those four bills of ₹1.75 lakh yes or no? He remains silent.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request again come Monday; Hagawane sir and the Board will be there.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** He already came and checked; you are again calling him this is wrong.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I'm not disputing. Yesterday at 5:30 when he came, he left; I had kept everything ready and requested him.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Now it feels like even the earlier secretary didn't know the bills.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Looking at the discussion, Chougule tell whether he knew or not. Auditor should speak too. If year closing happened on 28<sup>th</sup> March, that means full income expenditure is closed. Any expenses after that should go to next FY. Then why did you add bills sanctioned on 29<sup>th</sup> March after closing?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, these are provisions. If expense did not get paid in that year, payment happens in next FY.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Secretary sir if he has already checked the file and vouchers, and if ₹1.75 lakh bills are after 28 March, and secretary says he is not liable to sign did auditor notice these bills? We pay auditor a big fee; did auditor give any remarks?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Dhotre sir, these are provisions.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** How can 29 March bills be “provision”? Provision means to make; but bills came, meaning you received them. Auditor should speak let him say if he has seen and if it is clear.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Where is Shivaji? He didn't answer. It's his issue because he was secretary then.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Forget Shivaji how did it not come under auditor's eyes? Did auditor not remark?

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** No, answer his question. Does he know or not? Monday? We have been coming for 15 days; you make us sit for an hour each time thinking we will leave.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request the house it is almost 7 o'clock; we have many agenda items to pass.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Koli sir, I came at around 2 pm. I was given the file at 3:45. When you say “come, we will show,” there is a lot of obstruction. I say this in front of everyone: More sir says, “Chairman sir will call me or give consent, then I will give,” and after that consent, they take another person's name. This is wrong. We ask something, cameras are on, everything is there, and a person who came at 2 sits till 3:45 and then leaves at 4:30 this is to tire him so he gets frustrated and goes. Is this your method?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Wadekar sir, let me say one thing.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Bahubali sir, this is an important question.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As Hon. Secretary, I have been on medical leave since the 22nd of last month. During this period, if any members submitted questions to the Society and there was any delay in replying, I express my regret. My effort was that the entire Board should answer all questions. If there was any delay, I express regret. Even now, I request Rajapure sir to come; and if anyone else wants to come, please come I will answer everyone.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** One minute listen. You are expressing regret, but I will show you how many letters I have given and what your replies are. In last year's report

now the balance sheet will come down to that answer, right? If something was asked bills and vouchers what do you say? You say last year's bills and vouchers have already been cleared and passed, so you cannot show them. And if we ask for this year's bills and vouchers, you say they will be shown after the AGM is held. How does that make sense? Your reply has your signature. Now tell are you behaving correctly or not? You say earlier year's bills cannot be shown because the AGM has passed them, and if we ask for this year's, you say they can be shown only after they are passed. There is a contradiction in your own reply. I can show your papers if required.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** Secretary sir, what you are saying is correct.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** You are saying, "Give under Section 32." Whatever can be given in between, give everything.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Please when I asked for bills and vouchers, I got this reply: "Bills and vouchers of the previous financial year have already been passed, hence they cannot be shown to you; and the bills and vouchers of this financial year that you want to see will be shown after the AGM is passed."

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Not "after AGM is passed," sir after audit.

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** One minute sir, repeatedly telling a person, "We will show you in the office," and doing it like "come, we'll show you" don't do it like that. Sir, do you know what your managers do when we go to talk to them? First they show tablets from their pocket "See, I have BP problems, I have diabetes..."

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Please do not go into anyone's illness. I request you this is their matter. Why are you going personal? How can you speak like this about someone?

**Mr. Prabhat Singh (CDM):** When Rajapure sir is opposing every point you make, catching every point you say then keep Rajapure sir as an advisor. Give him a post there. Propose him to sit with you. For four years Rajapure ji has been pointing out each and every deficiency. Why haven't you made Rajapure ji an advisor? Why not why not honor him?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** We keep telling Rajapure sir to come to the society. He comes regularly from morning till evening.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I feel, Prabhat ji, that all documents have been shown to Rajapure sir. Let him say whether they were shown or not.

**Mr. Vivek Bhagdia:** With sir's permission, I am speaking. Rajapure sir I myself sat with you for 3-4 days. We discussed everything in detail. As much as I could satisfy you, I have satisfied you. Still, if you have doubts, let us sit at Mandela Society and discuss.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Let's solve it.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Okay.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD):** Look after the AGM, on Monday your so called rule applies, right? That after AGM nothing can be shown. Let that rule apply to us on Monday too better still, apply it for the whole year. If you won't apply it for a year, then we are ready to come. Okay, I have another question and you create confusion. A new head "Contingent Liability" has come this year. Give the house detailed information. Which page is it? It is on page 11. Why has this "contingent" come? What contingency? Are you planning something? Has something contingent happened? We want detailed information.

**Mr. Sachin Solse (HPD):** Hon'ble Chairman, I make an earnest request. Chairman sir , I request last week Bahubali was admitted in my ward, beside me. His kidney and other parameters are very critical. Sir, health is wealth. Please sit down and speak after taking the house's permission.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Thank you, sir. Vilas ji, your question comes later under profit appropriation. If you raise it now and approve profit distribution, it will be better for me people's dividend will get credited to their accounts sooner.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** On page 52, the SLF deposits made under 6P and 6G did you withdraw them pre maturity or after maturity? In Saraswat Bank it was ₹4 crore 48 lakh and on page 52 yes, page 52 and in Tilak Nagar Bank it was ₹1 crore 34 lakh. Did you withdraw them on maturity or pre maturity?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** All were withdrawn on maturity and reinvested.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** If you say they were withdrawn on maturity, then last year we made provision under accrued interest against that bank, but this year the interest received from that bank does not match. If you had withdrawn before maturity then it would be correct.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** They were withdrawn on maturity. The bank has given interest certificates. In "Schedule Investment" it is mentioned (as per what the bank gives). We take what the bank provides.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** So did the bank give wrong this year, or was it wrong last year?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Both are correct.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** If both are correct, then why doesn't it match in the balance sheet? That's why I asked maturity or pre maturity. I can show you. In assets, last year from Saraswat Co-operative Bank you showed interest receivable of ₹35 lakh 1,000. This year you have shown only ₹5 lakh 30,000 received from Saraswat Bank. If it was not pre mature withdrawal, then whatever you showed last year should have come this year.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** That day, on page 53, the figures under accrued interest are perfect the same amount. It also matches the interest certificate. If you have doubts, come.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Then was it shown wrongly last year?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** No.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Then where did the money go? It was invested, right? You withdrew from that bank; now there's no money there.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** If there is doubt, we will check and tell you those figures too. Come on Monday.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Chairman, on page 47, under Member Welfare Fund "Expenses for retired members, during the year" the figure shown is about ₹1 crore 30 lakh 71 thousand 211. As per my understanding, this is for gifts given to members mementos, shawls and some items about ₹500 per year, that's fine. But I have a doubt about shawls and I want to speak about it. When I checked the society's bills and vouchers file: dated 19/04/2024, Invoice No. 96 and Voucher JV 10195 dated 25 April 2024, the Board purchased from Sangam Textile, Kalbadevi, Mumbai: 100 shawls at ₹350 each and 50 shawls at ₹280 each. Then, just two months later, as per the bills and vouchers file, Voucher JV 224 dated 06 June 2024, from Hemant Textile, Old Lakad Mandi, Amritsar, Punjab, 350 shawls were purchased at ₹500 per piece. In April 2024, you were getting shawls at ₹280 in Mumbai; then why, just two months later, did you purchase shawls from Amritsar with railway shipping at ₹500 per piece? Please explain all at once. For the 350 shawls bought from Hemant Textile at ₹500 each: ₹1,75,000 plus 5% GST becomes ₹1,83,750. But if the same shawls had been bought from Sangam Textile, Mumbai at roughly ₹280 (or at similar lower rates), then  $350 \times 280 = ₹98,000$ ; plus 5% GST = ₹1,02,900. That means the society could have saved around ₹80,850. So tell us why was there a need to bring costlier shawls from Amritsar, causing an extra expense of ₹80,850?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Thank you, Wadekar sir. I will answer. Actually, in April 2024 we were buying shawls from Sangam Textile and distributing to members. BARC Establishment also felicitates its retired employees by giving shawls; the quality there was good. When our members came here, they said they get better quality there. We ourselves checked. The issue was discussed in the Board meeting, and it was decided that we should procure similar shawls from where the Establishment purchases them. Therefore, we made inquiries with BARC Establishment, and after inquiry, we ordered shawls from the same source from which they buy through open tendering, and we purchased from there. And regarding what you had made viral on WhatsApp

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Talk about what is here.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Along with that, the way you presented things on WhatsApp...

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Again you went to WhatsApp. Speak about what I raised here.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** The Board had purchased shawls from that source. This year also we ordered the same quality shawls and are giving them here.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Now tell me who told the Board that it must be purchased only from there? If good quality shawls are available here for ₹280, why did you go there?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** If you go to shops, you get shawls for ₹100, ₹2,000, even ₹20–25,000 depending on quality. Please understand this. Our society runs operations of ₹1,100–1,200 crore. (Kalke sir, one minute let me speak.) We bought good quality shawls at the same cost the department buys, and we are giving the same. If you want, we will show proof.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** There is a model number for the same shawl.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** One minute, Bhagdia sir, please sit. Let one person speak. Listen to what I am saying: Of the 350 shawls distributed to members, we took one shawl from a retired employee and showed it to a dealer in Amritsar, Punjab. He said he can supply such shawls at ₹220 each. We asked for a quotation, and he gave a quotation at ₹220 per shawl for 350 pieces. That means, in my opinion, by showing a ₹500 shawl and getting it at ₹220, the society suffered a loss of about ₹1,05,000.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** We sent the photo of the shawl to the Amritsar trader; he immediately identified it with model number etc. It all fits within ₹250 at most. Why did you go to the department to do this? In Mumbai Hindmata the whole world comes to buy shawls. Earlier also you brought shawls from there.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Kalke sir, may I answer?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** There is loss of one lakh. Because of one phone call, one lakh loss has happened.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Kalke sir, you raised points; now give a chance to reply.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Okay, speak.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** I request that the purchase was done by Director Mr. Anand Medar. I request him to present on this matter.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Namaskar.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Look, your Board because the one who purchased is coming to speak. That means even the secretary doesn't know anything.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Listen properly are the issues important, or the speaker important? Let people understand the real situation. Give me five minutes. I will tell what is true and false.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** You came in the middle.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** What I am saying, Wadekar...

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Wadekar, you will get the answer, right? He is answering. The issue should be resolved, or not? What problem do you have?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** I request, Wadekar folding hands. Please have two minutes' patience. Kalke sir, listen. You first said we bought shawls at ₹280 from Kalbadevi. Earlier, two shawls used to come from Sangam Textile one male and one female. Let me complete. Later you speak fully, sir. If not, you speak first, then I speak. Please give patience. If you want, Wadekar will speak and then I will speak.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Wadekar sir has done full study; let him speak fully.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** WhatsApp is not the question here. Answer what I asked here: Was there any guideline that we must buy only from there? If good quality shawls were available here, why did you go there?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Okay, you have two questions. Now I speak please have five minutes patience. Earlier, we used to order shawls from Sangam Textile, Mumbai, to felicitate members male shawl was ₹350 and female shawl was ₹280. Now we ordered a ₹500 shawl from Amritsar why? Because retired members requested that the department gives such a good shawl; why don't we get the same? Therefore we followed that route. We purchased the same shawl that the Establishment procures, at ₹500 from Amritsar. And when you say we went from ₹280 to ₹500 no, we did not go from ₹280 to ₹500; we went from ₹350 to ₹500.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** But did you search in Mumbai? Were Mumbai shops closed? Why?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** No, they were not.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Then why did you reach Amritsar?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Because this quality comes only from Amritsar and is not available in the market.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** It is available.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** If you have a question, may I answer Kalke sir?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** What answer do you even know?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Let's speak one by one so the actual point is understood.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** The shawl price is not low; it is high. If it was low, we would accept.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Kalke sir, you speak.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** If the price was low, we would accept. Your effort is that the price is higher than regular.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** One minute, Wadekar sir what you said is that they took shawl from ₹380 to ₹500.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Wadekar sir didn't even say ₹350; he said ₹280 he is misleading.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** Correct. Then I agree with you this is not that shawls are unavailable in Mumbai. Your point is: from ₹280 to ₹500 are you saying there is corruption of ₹150 per piece? Or what exactly are you saying? The issue is "why did you go up to ₹500," correct?

**Mr. Anand Medar:** His second question was: why go up to Amritsar. Purpose: in this market, that shawl's price is ₹750, but in Amritsar it is ₹500. Difference is ₹150. Now tell ₹500 shawl is a problem? Can we not spend ₹500 for someone retiring after 30-35 years? I feel it is shameful if the Board cannot take such a decision.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Earlier management did so much, now we are doing this was your topic: "we will reduce expenses compared to earlier management," but you are increasing. They printed calendars, you printed diaries. They gave ₹300, you are giving ₹500. What is your intent? You said you would reduce expenses, but you are increasing.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Patil sir, we did not increase expenses.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** How can you say not increased? They printed calendars, you printed diaries...

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Have the capacity to listen. If you have that capacity, I will tell you. Patil sir, listen.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** They gave ₹150, you are giving ₹500.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Patil sir, you are diverting. Stick to shawls. Please give me two minutes. I am trying to tell the house don't mislead. Let Kalke sir state his allegation.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Wadekar just told you: you brought ₹500 shawls. We inquired at the same shop; the opposite person was ready to give the same shawl for ₹250 (even ₹200). If the same thing is available for ₹250-₹200, why spend extra society money? That's the issue. We don't object just because you went to ₹500.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Sir, I repeat: your point is that a ₹500 shawl is available at ₹200 from the same shop then order in bulk from there. Not one order quantity.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Hello on Mahajan sir's point...

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Dhamdhere, now he spoke and you are interrupting why did you come in between?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** If you keep questioning one person in different ways, then while answering we have the right to state the points that occur to us. When you ask from ten angles, if a new point occurs to someone, he can state it. Directors have the right to place points. Now I answer Mahajan sir: They say we bought a ₹250 shawl at ₹500. Then Kalke sir contacted the vendor there will be a phone number on that quotation. Call that number and see if that shawl is actually available.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** If the same vendor gives shawl at ₹250 and you bought at ₹500, then call the vendor now truth will come out.

**Mr. Shabbir Alam (FTD):** Kalke sir call the owner right now.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Call the owner and ask him to give the ₹250 shawl bill at ₹500 and show the house. Ask whether a ₹500 bill is available from the manufacturer.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** If shawl is available for ₹250 and you bought at ₹500, call now and let the house know why. Ask if a ₹500 bill is available, and if ₹250 was "eaten."

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Ask on mic put the phone on speaker. Wadekar, call. You call.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Members should read this reply properly request.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Please read this reply on the board; listen to the vendor. Everyone sit down.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Sit down.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Do not misguide the house. Today Kalke sir asked for a quotation. Whatever came on that quotation, that letter got circulated on WhatsApp. We asked the vendor for clarification: "Our employee asked you for shawls; the shawl you gave us at ₹500, you offered to him at ₹250 how did you do that?" We asked for their reply. We are showing that reply here to all members; please read it. Also think: when someone creates an issue and defames the society and the Board, who is responsible?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** I will be responsible if I am lying. Everything is there; we have recorded it. If you put pressure on him and make him say something, that is wrong. The real question is: why ordered from Amritsar? Before that you ordered from Mumbai.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Mumbai has so many good shops and a big shawl market why did you go to Amritsar?

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** You put pressure on the shopkeeper and sent him the photo...

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I will read the letter in front of the honourable house. Everyone be silent for two minutes.

Hon. Secretary Mr. Bahubali Chougule read out the letter received by the society from **M/s Hemant Textile, Amritsar**, dated **22/08/2025**.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):**

To  
Hemant Koli,  
Chairman  
The BARC Emp. Co-op. Cr. Soc. Ltd. Mumbai

As we are associated with you for supplying shawl in your organisation in past. We supplied you the shawl named Chairman which was custom made just for your requirement and meeting the standards of your organisation. The shawl supplied to you was made of Acrowool material with soft finish along with corners design specially made just for your order and was supplied to your organisation at Rs. 530 plus GST 5%.

Now one of your society member Shri. Rajesh Ramchandra Kalke, has approached us for an order of different shawl whose quality number is No. 780. As this shawl is already manufactured by us in quantum for general selling purpose PAN India. This shawl No. 780 is cheaper and also less premium than Chairman shawl. Also the design and specification of the shawl No. 780 is totally different than shawl Chairman. That's why shawl No. 780 is priced at Rs. 220 plus GST 5%. But after sending the quotation to Mr. Rajesh Kalke, he approached us again over call and asked us to send one quotation of an adjusted price of Rs. 500 plus GST 5% for the same shawl No. 780, to which we clearly denied as in our manufacturing unit we never entertain any such kind of suspicious activities and mispricing. Our pricing policy is very clear and transparent. Please make sure that no one ever again from your organisation contact us for this kind of intentions and waste precious time of both the organisation.

M/s. Hemant Textile, Amritsar

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Now I will speak.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Now I will speak this Model No. 780 is what we order.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Let me speak. In June, a CDM retiree, Warang sir, I took a photo from him and sent the same photo to them and asked: "We want 350 shawls what is the price?" They told me ₹240. They immediately identified the same shawl because they are manufacturers. I asked ₹200; they said they can't. I asked ₹215; they said they will give at ₹220. I asked for quotation; they gave it. Our discussion is recorded and they mailed it. You said model number; they said this is the same model same shawl. What more should I say? This is the same shawl given to members.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Speak, speak, you are speaking correctly.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Sir, you are not facing the truth.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Everything is proceeding correctly.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Then what I told them was this, I asked them to give it to me at 215/-, but they said 220/-. I asked for a quotation, and then they explained everything to me. We discussed and recorded everything, and they also sent it by email. Now, you asked about the model number, they gave that information; this is the model number, and it is correct. There is nothing more to say. This is the same shawl that was given to the members.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** What I told you is: same design can be bought for ₹5,000 or ₹500 depends. You sent quotation; their reply came. Then the WhatsApp letter was sent to them for inquiry; their reply is placed here.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Even your Board doesn't know whether shawls were purchased or not.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Chairman...

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Please wait for two minutes. Listen, Mr. Kalke. There has been a miscommunication. Please hear me out; I will clarify it for you. The photo that you sent to them was forwarded to me by that person. I asked him how he could do this. Do you realize what you have done in that photo? You sent only half the photo. Regarding your tender, the numbering quotation that they have given listen carefully you did not send the complete photo. The same photo you sent was forwarded to me by him. He said, "Sir, this is the cost of the photo he sent, and I am forwarding it to you." Go to the site and verify it. If it is true, then call them and ask for a bill of ₹500. Do not mislead people unnecessarily.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Conduct an inquiry.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Mr. Kalke, do not do anything wrong and do not portray the Board of Directors as wrong. Whatever we have done is correct; you are trying to show it as wrong.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Why was it necessary to bring it from Amritsar?

**Mr. Anand Medar :** I already explained the necessity earlier, Mr. Kalke.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Now you... hey, where do you live, Perel?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Let us stick to the subject. Manoj Wadekar asked a question about the quotation, and we have given our reply.

**Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM):** The truth will come out clearly. Let us make a phone call and put it on speaker so everyone can hear.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** I ask the house if clarification has been received on this issue, please give proposer and seconder for the profit distribution resolution.

**Mr. Anil (DCSEM):** Instead of arguing, call the dealer. Mr. Koli, please call the dealer.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** We have already spent about 45 minutes on the shawl issue, and it is almost 7:30 pm. The matter of profit distribution is very important to everyone please proceed with it and allow people to leave. The shawl issue appears to be an investigation matter. The same item can cost ₹5 or ₹50. It needs investigation.

**Mr. Anil (DCSEM):** Mr. Chairman, if the turnover is ₹1,100 crore, then what is wrong with that?

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** The house wishes that a thorough investigation be conducted on this matter, and setting aside the minor aspects, a committee of four or five people should be declared to carry out this investigation.

**Security Officer, Anushaktinagar:** All members are saying the meeting should end by 7:30 pm. Please complete whatever is required peacefully.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Topic No. 2 is completed. I will now take Topic No. 3.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** In Topic No. 2, the papers we asked for were not shown. When quotations were invited for AC AMC, there were many problems. We were never shown the envelopes. The L1 party to whom the work was allotted its by post receipt was never shown. That L1 party does fabrication work; how was AC AMC awarded to them?

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** bhau, how was it given? Present the matter, on Monday I will show you.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** How was the AMC for the AC given?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** “I will show you on Monday.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Even if I came to the society for five days, it wasn't given. Now, what will you show on Monday? Nobody has shown it, and you haven't shown it either, sir.

**Shri. Bahubali Chougule:** I will show you.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** P32 rule was shown. Wadekar, did they show you?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Listen, I'll answer the sir's question. Shri Rukmini Vairalkar has requested that everyone look at the display. The question was whether the society took quotations for AC maintenance and whether the L1 (lowest bidder) envelope was given to the board. There was no envelope, no speed post, no invoice. Some information came through social media; whatever happened on that, as the secretary, I will show you again: the tenders received were from 1) Dashwa Engineering Works, 2) Friends Air Cool, 3) Yudnik Engineering. You noted the quotations. Your question was that on that day, the envelope was missing. That envelope exists at the site; it did not come to you.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Listen carefully, I asked More Sir, and he told us at the time that the envelope was not available, so the managers did not have it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** How can you say that, sir?

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Hello Wadekar Sir, the speed post number exists.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Hemant Sir, what is happening is that it was told to me it wasn't available. I will show you; now it has reached the office.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I showed you. It wasn't lost; it was there.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Listen, Bahubali Sir, the main issue is that there was information, but when it was asked, they didn't inform. I went back the next day and asked if the envelope had arrived, and they didn't report on it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Yes sir, as you can see, I am showing it from the platform. I am showing you the invoice.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** It was not available on that day, that's what is being reported.

**Mr. Anand Medar :** Mr. Wadekar, you are wasting everyone's time.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** “What wasn't there, wasn't available when it was checked.”

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** “Chairman Sir, please step back a bit. I request, Chairman Sir, please step back.”

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** When we checked, it wasn't found. Listen carefully, fully hear me out. When the file was checked, that item was not there. At that time, we called More Sir; he came and said, 'Listen, I am telling you what happened at that time. Don't talk about the current period. This issue hasn't been long ago. At that time, that item had not arrived.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Everything is there now. What else do you need? Everything is available, fully.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Don't try to make me appear false.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** You will appear false in this. You are misleading people. On WhatsApp, you misled people. You are definitely wrong here. They even made it viral.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request the entire house to please look at the desktop. He directly showed here that the L1 number is fake. What you sent on WhatsApp I have the right to now show it.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Let me speak. Why don't you listen? You speak before I present.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Please, I request, sir, let me speak.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** I am presenting the matter.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** I will show you everything. There is proof. Look.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Let me present the matter, let me put it before the House.

**Mr. Rahul Sharma (HWD):** There are many issues still. Please adjourn the meeting. Chairman sir, time is over—adjourn the meeting and plan it.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** I also request you to lower your voice.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Okay, sorry. I request the entire House and the Directors to go and sit on your respective chairs. Everyone should go back to their places. For approving the profit distribution for the financial year 2024–25, I request the House to give a proposer and a seconder. We have to approve the profit distribution.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Hello give a proposer, give a seconder.

**Mr. Rahul Sharma (HWD):** Please adjourn the meeting.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The subjects will get completed.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Hello, let me speak my issue is not finished.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** After that, I will read the next item.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Let me speak. Monthly Meeting No. 3 dated 01/07/2024, page no. 19—A resolution is being passed that for the Society's Air Conditioner AMC for FY 2024–25, a total of four tenders were received, as follows. Now, you had written those four—have those tenders been printed or not? Check your minutes book.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, that is a printing mistake.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** So now you have come to that side meaning earlier I was lying? Now please accept that there is some truth in what I am saying. Members, please sit on your chairs only a little is remaining.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Please do not cut my line. Listen to me at least let me speak for two minutes. First, you recorded in the monthly meeting that four companies' AC tenders came, but we could see documents/details of only three companies. The three quotations are: Shiva Engineering, Friends Air Cool, and Unique Engineering. Now if we see the address of Unique Engineering Chawl No. 3, LXA-259, Kurla, Safed Pool—and when we checked, Netaji Nagar is at some other location, Safed Pool is at another location, and Chawl No. 3 does not exist there. So the address was false—this is the first point.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Listen

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** Further, their HSN number is 9954280. As per that, what they have given under GST shows “work from handling of pipe and fabrication work”, meaning fabrication work. When we called Unique Engineering, they said: “Brother, we actually do not do air-conditioning work; our company doesn't do it, we do fabrication.” After that, L2 is Friends Air Cool, this genuinely works; as per their GST number/HSN they do the relevant work. After that is Shiva Engineering, this company is from Ulwe; earlier this company had done our Mandakini shed work, and this company does fabrication work. Their work profile is “all types of fabrication works,” and this is also recorded in their HSN. When we called them too, they said: “We do not do air-conditioning, AC repairing, or AMC type work.” Then in that case, are two of these quotations fake or not? Look at the current reality and tell me, what is true and what is false.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Enough, Chougule, show it now.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Mr. Wadekar and the entire House, please pay attention. Mr. Wadekar wrote a letter and also wrote on WhatsApp that the “envelope tender was missing.” After that, I showed the envelope—point number one. We struck off that point there itself. Now the second issue: he kept writing “fake, fake,

fake.” So I will clearly show: these two companies first, Shiva Engineering Works this company has 30 to 40 orders from BARC. I am presenting the work orders before the entire House. They have work related to piping installation, ventilation system, chilling everything. I am presenting about a hundred pages of work here; anyone who wants can come to the Society office and see. I will show work completion also.

Then I come to the second point Sir, your question is over, right? You used the word “fake, fake, fake.” Now the second party is Unique Engineering. This is its address. This firm has orders in BARC from 2014 to 2025 worth more than about 50 lakh. There are many orders from AMMD division, TSD, CED, and other divisions. They have GEM orders, DPS orders—everything. I am presenting these to the House. Therefore, it is proved that both companies are not fake. The “envelope is missing” point—this is completely an attempt to defame the Board of Directors and the entire Society. Now I showed you the quotation already. This is L1. One minute—Sir, you also do not shout. I am speaking calmly; both our BP will remain calm. Here is the quotation.

**Mr. Shibu Singha Roy:** Chairman sir, I want permission to speak. Shiva Engineering Works and Unique Engineering—these two companies take contracts in BARC for different jobs. After defining their work profiles, we opened the tender. After opening the tender, we saw that these parties have given quotations. In Mandakini office, for experience, this company was given an AC maintenance job; they fixed the AC and maintained Mandakini’s AC. Based on that, after ten days, a work order was issued to them. Presently, work worth crores—both these companies are working inside BARC. Today, at least 50 people are working inside BARC.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex-Officio President):** Wadekar, we do almost 200 to 300 crore worth of work every year. Hey listen—have I finished? If the same party has been given work in BARC, it is given only after thorough scrutiny. Leave the letterhead aside—there are at least 25 points. As per that, evaluation is done and then work is given. Evaluation is not done just on the letterhead. If they have worked in BARC or any DAE unit or government unit, don’t go by the letterhead. He is a genuine party. Wadekar, note this: BARC has evaluated them, so I don’t think there is any need to test them again on some other scale.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** We contacted them over phone.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex-Officio President):** That’s exactly what I mean. Listen carefully: if the vendor name is the same, office address is the same, GST number is the same, and BARC has issued work orders—and there are many more parameters you can verify in the work order—then I don’t think there is any need to doubt it. And if you see the scrutiny, come, I will show you how technical scrutiny is done—there is an evaluation committee, an SO/G level committee. First Part-A and Part-B; in Part-A there are at least

25 points—actually almost 3 pages: financial turnover, profit & loss, definition of similar works, how much work they have done, percentage as per work—very detailed. A committee of 4–5 people, with a senior SO/G level person as Chairman.

I won't go deeper into that. I am saying the tendering process in BARC involves much more detailed investigation than just letterhead decisions. So, in my personal view, if it is the same party and nature of work is the same, there is no need for doubt. Have a neutral stand.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex-Officio President):** I am also saying this, Rajapure—one second, Wadekar. Actually, in the tendering process, you are not permitted to personally contact the vendor. As per rules, any documents you get—whether it is a 5-lakh job or a 500-crore job—on the basis of the documents submitted, technical evaluation is done. Listen: even for the L1 party, we are not supposed to contact directly. These are rules and regulations as per the Government. Let's not wander here and there. Wadekar, I am only speaking about this. Let's not take leaps. What are we talking about? Not about the tender—this is discussion about the AMC. I'm telling you only what the tendering process in BARC is. I'm not competent to answer beyond that.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Please—don't stop the meeting. We have to finish the meeting. We will present all issues.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** A loss of 54 lakhs has occurred—who is responsible, what action was taken? For one to two years we have been writing letters; you do not take any action. And remember—you were elected on that very point. In the TDS matter, the Society suffered a loss of 54 lakhs—why are you not taking legal action? In the moratorium matter, the Society suffered a loss of 50 lakhs. For how many more years will this continue?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, the balance sheet is approved now, isn't it?

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Who approved the balance sheet?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Approval came in the House, sir.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** The balance sheet has not been approved.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** It has been approved. You are raising the issue again, and what you are saying is from the figures of the last financial year's approved balance sheet, sir.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** If not, then run it for another half hour and whatever you are saying.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Come to the Society office those things will be clarified.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Not in the Society office. Last year, in the meeting, you had agreed that you would send a letter to the old committee and take legal action. What action did you take? Our loss is 54 lakhs who will repay it? That day there was an informal meeting at the Chairman's place; the legal expert said this is the responsibility of both Boards. A loss of 54 lakhs has happened—who will take responsibility? Tomorrow you will also leave.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Are you saying 34 lakhs?

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I am saying 54 lakhs.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** How did you calculate 54 lakhs?

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I will tell you listen. Now I will explain the 54 lakhs. Send a letter.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** We will send a legal notice again.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Rajapure, put a resolution—on whom to file a case. Give proposer and seconder.

**Mr. Anand Medar:** Sir, listen—I will answer. Mr. Rajapure, we understand your genuine concern. But on this TDS issue, let us all work together and resolve it. Why are you consuming everyone's time by spending time like this? Is it an allegation that the Board of Directors deliberately committed a "TDS fraud"? Tell us—who committed the TDS fraud?

**Agenda Item No. 2:** To accept and approve the Annual Report for the period 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025 and the statutory audited Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account as on 31 March 2025.

**AGM Resolution No. 2:** It was resolved that the Annual Report for the period 1 April 2024 to 31 March 2025 and the statutory audited Balance Sheet and Profit & Loss Account as on 31 March 2025 were accepted and unanimously approved.

**Proposer: Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)**

**Secunder: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)**

**The resolution was unanimously passed.**

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** It is now 7.45 there are many points. If we want to complete the meeting, we must move ahead.

**Agenda Item No. 3:**

To approve the profit distribution for financial year 2024–25.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Approval of profit distribution request proposer and seconder.

**Agenda No. 3 – Approval of Profit Distribution for FY 2024–25**

**Resolution No. 3:** The society earned a net profit of ₹15,60,06,904/ for FY 2024–25, with a previous balance of ₹25,18,962/. Total profit available for distribution: ₹15,85,25,866/

The profit distribution as proposed by the Board was approved unanimously:

<b>Particulars</b>	<b>Amount (₹)</b>
Statutory Reserve @10%	1,56,00,690
Dividend @15% on Share Capital	4,11,45,263
Contingent Liability	2,15,00,000
Election Provision	5,00,000
Member Welfare Fund	22,50,000
Statutory Liquidity Fund	4,00,00,000
Vikram Loan Protection Fund	3,50,00,000
Bonus to Member Future Assistance Fund	14,49,153
Death Assistance Fund	5,40,000
Co-operative Training Fund	5,00,000
Employee Welfare Fund	25,000
Balance Carried Forward	15,760

Particulars	Amount (₹)
<b>Total</b>	<b>15,85,25,866</b>

**Proposer:** Mr. Sachin Solse

**Seconder:** Mr. Dhananjay Dhende (DCSEM)

The resolution was unanimously passed.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** After that, I will read the next agenda item.

**Agenda Item No. 4:**

To approve excess expenditure over the budget sanctioned for FY 2024–25 and to approve the budget presented by the Board of Directors for FY 2025–26.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Three items are remaining let's do them. We are moving quickly to the next item. Time is being wasted. Patil ji, I will get the meeting time extended. Please sit down. Security has given extra time. Please sit this is going on deliberately. I request the House to sit in your places.

**Mr. Avinash Tirpude (Ex-Officio Vice President):** Please silence.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request the House please go to your places and sit. Hon. members, brothers and sisters. Mahajan sir, security has given permission. People at the back can hear; everyone can hear. Why are you adjourning on your own? Do you want to run the meeting after adjourning? The Ex-Officio President is still on his seat.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Everyone sit down. Make them sit, Kambale sir. Please, Sonawane sir.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Please the Ex-Officio President, Vice President, and the Society's Chairman are still present on the dais. Security has given time. Why are you adjourning the meeting on your own? This is a matter close to members' hearts. I will read the next item: to approve excess expenditure over the sanctioned budget for FY 2024–25 and approve the budget for FY 2025–26, as per the agenda issued on the 8th.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Chougule sir, which agenda item is going on? Nine items are still pending.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, please sit down please sit.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Prakash Patil, sit down you are wasting time. Sit down.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** One minute, Chairman sir hello. We have been sitting here for the last four to five hours. But the tendering process is such an issue did the committee's answer come correctly or not? What answer do you have on that?

**Mr. Santosh Kambale (EMAD):** the report has not yet been approved.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** How can you forcibly pass the profit distribution? How can you pass this agenda item like this?

**Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, the House has given a proposer and seconder for the profit distribution. There is confusion and commotion going on here, sir.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Explain the ₹2 crore 15 lakh to us. In the profit distribution, ₹2 crore 15 lakh what is this "Contingent Liability" item? Tell us what it is.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** The recruitment issues are still pending.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Everyone, please sit down.

**Mr. Manoj Khedekar (SIRD):** Something feels wrong in the entire tendering process; we have not received a proper answer on this.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** What exactly is this liability item?

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** You have accepted and approved the balance sheet. The third agenda item also Proposer: Prakash Patil

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** One minute.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Yes Rajapure, sit calmly.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Agreed to their request—the third agenda item also—

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request approval for the budget presented by the Board of Directors for FY 2025–26. While presenting this budget to the House, I place before you a budget estimate of ₹105 crore 25 lakh for approval. It is kept for approval on pages 58–59. I request a proposer and seconder.

**AGM Resolution No. 4: It was resolved that members unanimously approved the expenditure that exceeded the sanctioned budget for FY 2024-25.**

**It was further resolved that the House unanimously approved the budget proposed by the Board of Directors for FY 2025-26.**

**Proposer: Mr. Vilas Ghorpade**

**Seconder: Mr. Santosh Kambale**

**The resolution was unanimously passed.**

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex-Officio President):** I have spoken to the concerned authority. They had allowed up to 8:00; I have obtained an extension up to 8:30. So please, let us finish everything by 8:30.

## **DRAFT 64th AGM**

**Agenda Item / Resolution No. 5 (Statutory Audit Report – Taking Note)**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Agenda Item No. 5: To take note of the statutory auditor's audit report for FY 2024-25. I request a proposer and seconder.

**Annual General Meeting Resolution No. 5** It was resolved that the statutory audit report for FY 2024-25 submitted by Government/Statutory Auditors M/s. SAAJ & Associates (Partner CA Jagdish Randive) and the remarks therein be accepted, and compliance of the remarks be ensured. The resolution was unanimously passed.

Proposer: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)

Seconder: Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)

The resolution was unanimously passed.

**Agenda No 6: Appointment of Statutory Auditor for FY 2025-26**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Agenda Item No. 6: Appointment of statutory auditor for FY 2025-26.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Tell us who is your preferred/trusted person and show the quotation.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** We have received five tender proposals for Statutory Auditor for FY 2025–26 (Proposal for Statutory Auditor Financial Year 25–26), as follows:

1. M/s. D. G. Kango Associates, Pune
2. M/s. Jain Chowdhary & Company
3. M/s. AVSM & Associates
4. M/s. Nikita Jadhav & Associates
5. M/s. SAAJ & Associates (L1)

Among these, the lowest quote is from **M/s. SAAJ & Associates – ₹12,58,238.79/** .

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Secretary Sir, one minute this is at 85%, so it will be L1, right? Even earlier, SAAJ & Associates did the audit, and there were many mistakes. Is it proper to award it again to SAAJ?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** What mistakes?

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Rajapure has proven it under Point No. 5 that there are mistakes in the accounts. Then why should we give it again to SAAJ? Last year their quote was 90%; why has it come down to 85% this year?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Last year 90%, this year 85%. Second thing: till now there has been so much noise about the report. They don't even want to give that report before the AGM/House. If you want to give it, give it. But if they made so many mistakes, do not give it to them.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Mr. Dhotre, tell us what exactly you want.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Give it to the next one. My preference is to appoint **L2**, the one with **95%**, so at least errors will be fewer.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Do as per rules, because quotations have been called. Follow the tender procedure. It should not happen that someone goes to court. Think straight. Legal advisers are present take their advice.

**Mr. Shabir Alam (FTD):** Mr. Ghorpade, last time also when objections were raised, L2 was appointed instead of L1. Was it against rules? Did anyone go to court?

**Mr. Shabir Alam (FTD):** Rajapure has identified so many mistakes then is it appropriate?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** As per the Legal Adviser's view

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Last time, L2 was taken.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Mr. Vilas Ghorpade asked Advocate Nimbalkar accordingly. He said that the General Body can appoint the Chartered Accountant as it decides. This is the opinion given now.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** One minute there is a technical issue. L2 has already submitted quotation for statutory audit, and they also submitted a quotation for internal audit. Since they are **L1 for internal audit**, they have been appointed as internal auditor, and therefore they cannot be given the statutory audit.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** If L2 is not possible, take L3.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** Let me put my view. Take anyone, but we brought partial withdrawal for members' TDS and also passed one-two-three other things; in that process, this auditor's guidance has been very helpful. For the Society's benefit, Dhotre sir, guidance is happening.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** If guidance is happening, then don't even call for quotations directly tell the House you want only this one. Personally, I am saying: take SAAJ, but don't show quotations why are you misleading?

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** Mr. Dhotre, for the society's interest if any mistake has happened, then file a case against the auditor. I recommend clearly: if the society has suffered even one rupee loss, or if it suffers in future, the society will directly file a case against the auditor. But my humble request is in the interest of the society and Co-operative sector work.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** We are telling the House take L3, isn't it?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Patil, please listen fully.

**Mr. S. S. Mahajan (FRD):** Sir, allow me one sentence: We agree to SAAJ, but if such mistakes happen again, they must pay a fine. Are they ready?

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** In tendering, rejecting L1 can become troublesome legally. If someone goes for arbitration, the society may have to incur significant expenses.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** In this process, certain interests are also protected, Sir.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** I am speaking only about documentation.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Even if problems may arise, there can be paperwork issues. Still, the Board seems to be insisting somewhere interests appear to be protected. There is no doubt. However, respecting the Board's request, we accept L1.

### **Annual General Meeting Resolution No. 6**

#### **Resolution No. 6:**

**It was resolved that out of the total 5 Nos. of Tenders are received, M/s. SAAJ & Associates be appointed as Statutory Auditor for the period FY 2025-2026, considering their prior experience with the society and the fee quoted as 85% of the working capital of the Balance Sheet for FY 2024-25. Further, the Board of Directors is authorized to take necessarily follow up action.**

**Proposer: Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED)**

**Seconder: Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)**

**The resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Agenda No 7: Reading of Audit Defects for FY 2023-24 and Noting the Defect Rectification Report**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The report received is about 11 pages.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Display it and read it out.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I will read the major points. The report recommends:

- Conduct a **system audit** (action has been initiated).
- TDS is being deducted quarterly; it should be deducted **monthly**, and filing should also be monthly.
- **Internal audit** should be carried out without fail every **three months**, and appropriate action should be taken on the report.
- PF should be invested in the society's PF account; accordingly, LIC has been contacted and correspondence has been done with the PF Registrar, Pune.

### **Annual General Meeting Resolution No. 7**

**Resolution No. 7: It was resolved that after reading out the audit defects for FY 2023–2024, the House noted the rectification of defects and the defect rectification report, and that the said report/notes be submitted for information to the Hon'ble Cooperation Commissioner, Co-operative Societies, Pune. This resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Proposer:** Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)

**Seconder:** Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)

**The resolution was approved unanimously.**

### **Agenda Item No. 8**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Moving to item no. 8. Agenda Item No. 8: To approve the by-law amendments proposed by the Board of Directors as per Appendix 'A'.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** As per the proposed amendment (Appendix 1), the Society's authorized share capital was ₹50 crore. As per the new amendment proposal, we are placing a proposal to increase it to ₹100 crore, considering members' share-holding capacity. Further, the Society's individual member share-holding capacity, currently ₹15,000, is proposed to be increased to ₹5 lakh, subject to Section 28 of the Maharashtra Cooperative Act, 1960, and is placed before the House.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** See, Secretary sir—we are increasing from ₹15,000 to ₹5 lakh. But anyone who wants to take a ₹50 lakh loan must have shares worth ₹5 lakh—this becomes necessary.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Two lakh—there was a Government circular. In that circular, it is mentioned that minimum shareholding of ₹5 lakh—wording like that. Therefore we are keeping that wording here. While sending, we send ₹30,000. We have not put ₹30,000–₹45,000 here. We are increasing from ₹15,000 to ₹30,000, right? This wording is as per the Government circular.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** With the Chairman's permission—actually there is a Government circular. Earlier the maximum capacity for individual share capital was ₹2 lakh; now it has changed to ₹5 lakh. Now ₹5 lakh can be the maximum individual share capital—this is written. But it is not compulsory that we must go to ₹5 lakh. And one more very important thing: after April 2020, due to 194 article, many members faced TDS. In this financial year it became ₹50,000 on interest, ₹10,000 elsewhere, and on dividend—Ghorpade sir, if we send for approval ₹30,000 or ₹45,000 and go up to ₹45,000, those

people who are near the TDS threshold (whose interest is around ₹52–53k) will get converted into share capital, and the dividend they get next year can increase from ₹2,250 (where we were stuck) to ₹7,000–8,000–9,000. With that aim, I request the House to approve this by-law amendment. Proposer and seconder—this is what I want to speak on.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Shivaji, what is the borrower's liability?

**Mr. Vijay Shelke (TPD):** I want to speak on this point. One minute this ₹15,000 made ₹25,000 or ₹30,000—whatever I received (9 plus 6), I will receive that much. How much will I get? Right now on ₹15,000 at 15% (9 + 6) I get ₹2,250, correct. If you make it ₹1 lakh or ₹5,000—today if you do ₹45,000, how much will I get? Will I get multiples? I have capacity I want to do ₹2 lakh but I cannot.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** I will explain—listen, sir. I am answering. You were getting 15% on ₹15,000. Take an example—if we make it ₹45,000, meaning the additional ₹30,000—how much were you getting there? 10%, right? Every financial year, whatever the balance sheet states, accordingly we can do profit distribution. We cannot comment in advance on profit distribution. Still, I give you my word: on ₹45,000, what you receive now—₹2,250 plus on the additional ₹30,000, about ₹3,000—total about ₹5,200—definitely you will get more than this. I assure the House.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Individual shareholding capacity: ₹45,000/-

**AGM Resolution No. 8: It was resolved to increase the Society's authorized share capital from ₹50 crore to ₹100 crore to increase members' shareholding capacity.**

**It was further resolved that, as per Government notification dated 24.04.2024 and subject to Section 28 of the Maharashtra Cooperative Act, 1961, the Society may accept member shareholding limit from ₹15,000 (30 shares of ₹500) up to ₹5 lakh (1000 shares of ₹500). The House approved and resolved to send the amendment to the Hon. Cooperative Commissioner, Pune for approval at the earliest.**

**Proposer: Mr. Vijay Shelke (TPD)**

**Secunder: Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR)**

**The resolution was unanimously passed.**

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** For a borrower, how much share capital should be mandatory for someone who wants to take a loan ₹2 lakh or ₹5 lakh?

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** One minute according to our by-laws, for a borrower, shares plus subscription that total amount should be ₹2 lakh. If it is ₹2 lakh, then he will get ₹50 lakh loan.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** The last point is about the interest rate it must be lower than the member loan interest rate.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** That is about interest on subscription.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Then how much do you give? Interest rate on subscription how much do you give?

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** Dividend and subscription interest are different subjects. The current subject is dividend. As per by-laws, the subscription interest this year we gave 10%, okay. But because we reduced the rate in the last quarter, we gave 10% there, Ghorpade sir. In future you are Directors.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** No, I am not talking about the future.

**Mr. Shivaji Hagwane:** It will be as per what the balance sheet indicates.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Do not make such an incorrect statement.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex-Officio President):** Next agenda item.

## **Agenda Item No. 9:**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Agenda Item No. 9: As per the Society's by-laws, to hold detailed discussion and take a decision on enrolling retired members as nominal members.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** Please explain this a bit.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** I oppose enrolling Society members as nominal members after retirement.

**Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD):** He does oppose it, but let them explain. Please explain.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request members to look at the full data. I am trying to place the last 10 years' data before the members—annual report with year-wise membership. Over the last 10 years, we have gradually come down from about 22,500 members to around 18,510. Every year, around 900 to 1,000 members retire, and hardly 400 to 500 new members join—this is the membership data.

If we look at the Society's loan capacity, in the last 10 years it has increased from about ₹370 crore to about ₹1,000 crore. But at this rate, the Society's own funds and internal funds are not growing.

In future, please see two things—interest and investment. Since FY 2021–22, as per the income-tax provisions, our deposits are also gradually decreasing. The Board's proposal is that, in future, if the Pay Commission comes in 2026 and members' loan capacity increases—currently about 10,600 members are eligible for loans up to around ₹35 lakh and some are eligible up to ₹50 lakh—after the Pay Commission, when many members become eligible up to ₹50 lakh, the Society will have to borrow funds from outside because deposits are reducing. And to borrow, having adequate own funds is very important. Alternatively, we must arrange deposits from somewhere. Accordingly, the Board is placing before the House a proposal: make retired members nominal members again and accept deposits from them. Our by-laws also allow taking nominal members and giving them membership.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Secretary sir, you said around 900–950 members retire; membership has reduced; deposits have reduced. But 4,300 new vacancies have come these people will sooner or later become members of our Society. And regarding FD due to the annual chaos created by this Board every year, our credibility has reduced somewhere. So before doing an FD, people think four times and only then do it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir, that is your personal opinion.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Let it be. For the proposal you put up, everyone will have to give their personal view—who thinks what about it.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** The reason for FD reduction is different. Since the time the Society came under income tax, FDs have been decreasing.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** My personal view is clear: I oppose this proposal.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Bahubali sir, before you brought this amendment, it was already in practice in our Society. When it was in practice, why was it stopped? That should be explained. Was it stopped because income-tax cases increased? So, if there are experts our expert Director Arun Koli sir he should guide and explain to the House.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** This is an important matter.

**Mr. Arun Koli (CDM):** Thank you friends. As per Maharashtra Government rules, the Society has exemption under 80P. We have been fighting the income-tax case since around 2012, and up to around 2016 the decisions have largely come in our favor.

In future, if the Society accepts “outside funds / members” (i.e., beyond salaried employees), then the Income Tax office may withdraw our exemption. Because when the court matter comes, currently we are taking the stand that we have only employees as members. If we decide like this, Income Tax can directly say: you have taken outside members, they are not your eligible members—so in future, maybe not immediately, but if income-tax rules change, then like the previous Board had to stop this, we too may have to stop it.

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Then we will stop it then.

**Mr. Arun Koli (CDM):** The decision should be taken by the General Body.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED):** Why this hurry now? If income-tax cases come later, will this Board give a written undertaking that it will bear the cost of those cases?

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Rajapure sir, this matter was taken up for discussion in the House. If it is not to be approved, then take proposer and seconder; we will record that resolution accordingly.

**AGM Resolution No. 9: It was resolved that considering the potential issues under Income Tax Act section 80(P)(I)(II) if retired members are taken as nominal members, the General Body unanimously approved to drop/remove this agenda item from the proceedings.**

**Proposer: Mr. Prakash Patil (SIRD)**

**Seconder: Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR)**

**The resolution was unanimously passed.**

**Agenda No 10: Manager Recruitment, Go Cashless (Instant Banking) and Career Junction Placement 1 – Presentation and Discussion**

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Agenda Item No. 10: To present information and discuss in the House regarding Manager recruitment, Go Cashless (instant banking), and Career Junction Placement-1. I will place information about Go Cashless India Pvt. Ltd. before the House. Also, I will inform the House regarding Manager recruitment and instant banking.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I will read the Manager recruitment agenda. Regarding recruitment of Manager, I inform the House: in 2019–20 the then Board tried

to recruit a Manager. This Board attempted recruitment twice—January 2024 and December 2024—but both attempts failed. In the 2024 advertisement, total 32 applications were received; only 2 were valid, but there were document problems, so the committee rejected them. Again in December, we issued another advertisement; about 54 applications were received; only 4 were valid. I present these applications before the House. We analyzed the data. As per the Gangurde report (2011 Board), the Manager qualification was: B.Com with 50% marks, age 45 years, and 10 years' experience as Assistant Manager. In 2020, they put M.Com/MBA because the Society's finances improved and they felt higher qualification would be better, and income-tax procedures had started. In 2024 we again used the same base—M.Com / GDC&A etc.—age 45 as per Gangurde committee; but still problems arose and it was rejected. The scrutiny committee suggested: since you failed in both attempts, follow the actual Gangurde committee report terms and conditions.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Members know all this. In a recent meeting in the Chairman's board room, we called a cooperative consultant. The current problem is: because the service requirement is 10 years, we cannot recruit an Assistant Manager level person. Even the cooperative consultant says so. Now, since the Gangurde committee report was approved by the General Body, can we relax those conditions? We asked the administration/controlling authority—today the House should take up this matter because whenever we go to the establishment/department, there is delay. Cooperative experts are present. As per Cooperative Department rules, some institutions can conduct the manager recruitment process for us (application checks, whether it's the same person, etc.). The House is requested: if we again go for relaxation and then go back to the department and form a new committee, it will take more time. I open this forum if there are questions, ask the cooperative experts. The Board's honest intention is: if we reach a correct decision today, we can start the manager recruitment process quickly. Thank you. We may have to increase the age limit because at 45 we are not getting candidates we have tried.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Criteria cannot be decided immediately here; recruitment rules (RR) may need overall amendments, not relaxation for only one post. It cannot be done in such haste.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Should we decide to write again to the department through the General Body, or decide what process should be followed, because departmental approvals cause delay?

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Even if it is somewhat acceptable for the General Body, we have also made inquiries outside. Regarding how managers are being recruited what is being done is that in many cases there are only two people: office bearers and then one person becomes a manager. Many people come forward, five people are below, and one becomes

the manager. This will be very harmful to our society. Today it is 1100; next year it may become 1200–1300 so do not change the rules, because once you recruit a manager now, the long-term effect will appear later. After 7–8 years, the impact will be such a sudden and severe collapse that nobody will be able to save it.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** What I say is: approach the administrative authority and ask them to find a way out. If they do not respond the first time, go again a second time.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED)** This issue of manager appointment has been continuing for many days. We keep forming committees. Rather than waiting till the next AGM, if a committee can be formed comprising knowledgeable people and a solution can be found, then make the first attempt.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Thank you. I request the House earlier we made a committee of 10; can we again discuss with those people and proceed?

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** This manager appointment issue has been going on for many days. We keep forming committees. Instead of waiting till next AGM, if a committee of knowledgeable people can find a way, try that first or hold a special meeting.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Okay. As Mr. Parab said, if we approach the Co-operative experts regarding manager recruitment, we may get a solution.

**Mr. Vijay Shelke (TPD):** Sir, I have one suggestion: if we approach our retired members (only from BARC), we may get suitable candidates.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President) :** My suggestion is this: this work has been pending for a long time. If we want to fast track it, form a small committee of experts senior people so it will be faster. You already have data: what problems occurred, how long we tried, and why it failed. Let that committee review it along with the Managing Committee and prepare a letter to the Establishment/Administration asking whether we can make some changes to the recommendations of the Gangurde Committee. If there is a genuine problem, someone will support us. The Establishment will not refuse without reason.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** Our point is that we have strong confidence that they (the administration) should find a way out.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Alright. Regarding manager recruitment, we will review the Gangurde Committee report, form a committee of our experts, introduce suitable relaxation where required, and record this information in the minutes.

**Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (AFD):** If we talk about changing the Recruitment Rules (RR), then it should change for everyone.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** As per the point list/agenda.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Regarding manager recruitment and recruitment rules, we will reconsider afresh. A committee of Co-operative field knowledgeable members and expert directors will work on it, and we will get it approved as early as possible in a special meeting.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Even if you pass it in the AGM, it is not necessary that the Establishment will respect it. You and the Managing Committee should sit together, list out the exact problems faced, and submit your proposal to the Establishment.

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** Santosh, as you said, include people who have worked in the Managing Committee. Here we have Mr. Rajapure everyone sees his experience in every General Body. Take people who have knowledge; they are working well on these issues.

# DRAFT 64<sup>th</sup> AGM

## Annual General Meeting Resolution No. 10

**Resolution No. 10: It was resolved that the recruitment rules for manager recruitment should be reconsidered and freshly drafted, and that the rules should be framed based on the experience of present/former members and the recruitment process should be carried out. It was further resolved that for this purpose, a General Body approval is not required.**

**This resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Proposer: Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD)**

**Seconder: Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)**

**The resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Mr. Hemant Koli:** Thank you. Now, regarding Go Cashless, we have only four minutes; they will close at 8:30. Next topic: Go Cashless speak.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary) – Information on Go Cashless Pvt. Ltd.** I will provide brief information on Go Cashless Private Limited. In 2019, the then Board entered into an agreement (for immediate banking/instant credit to members' accounts) with Pune based Go Cashless Private Limited. Before executing the agreement, the 12th special meeting discussed this company's features/advantages under Agenda Item No. 4.

Then in the 15th special meeting (Agenda Item No. 4), it was approved that the society would provide this service to members. Accordingly, an agreement was executed. The agreement was made in October 2019 and it was for three years (36 months), expiring on 07.10.2022. It was not renewed thereafter. The agreement was on a stamp paper of ₹100. The micro-ATM/software cost was ₹4,00,000 plus 18% GST, and the machine related transaction was dated 13.11.2019. After this Board took charge in December 2022, it was noticed that an amount was outstanding from Go Cashless Private Limited. The society repeatedly communicated by email during 2023-24. Then an email was received from the company stating that the owner Mr. Krushnat Maruti Channe had passed away. The society conveyed condolences. Regarding our demand letter dated 22.06.2024, the society received an email on 28.06.2024 stating that earlier directors had expired/changed, and the current directors are Mr. Akash Jadhav and Ms. Komal Patil.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** Members were consistently asking about this issue, so it has been taken up in this AGM. All documents are available for members to see in the society office. In short: approximately **₹1.64 crore** of the society remains recoverable. We are corresponding with them. We have called a Co-operative act expert advocate (legal adviser) who will guide us; please listen so that we can take a proper decision and work fast.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** Mr. Nimbalkar, one minute was Go Cashless approved by the AGM?

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Whether the AGM approved it or not, there are issues: the previous Board made certain mistakes in the agreement this is the legal part. But the amount of about **one crore and something** is recoverable.

To recover money from Go Cashless, you have two legal routes:

1. **Civil Law / Civil Court:** If you want to recover from the private limited company, you will have to file a civil case. Since it is a private limited company, how much recovery is actually possible is a practical aspect within civil law options.
2. **Co-operative Act route (against the previous Directors):** Under the Co-operative Act, you can proceed via **Section 83 enquiry, Section 88 (fixing responsibility and recovery), and Re audit.** If in Section 83 enquiry it is found that it was the responsibility of the Directors, then under Section 88 responsibility is fixed and the recoverable amount can be recovered from them. So the General Body must decide whether to proceed under civil law against Go Cashless, and/or under the Co-operative Act against the previous Board.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Can both actions be taken?

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Yes, both actions can be taken simultaneously.

**Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM):** Then let's take both and decide accordingly.

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Yes

**Shri. Rajesh Kalke (CDAR):** "Doesn't that include a re-audit part?"

**Advocate Shri. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Under the cooperative proceedings, there will be a re-audit.

**Shri. Prabhat Singh (CDAR):** Koli Sir, you are also our new expert, so please give your opinion on this. I request you—please speak up, you have been appointed, so say something about this."

**Shri. Prakash Patil (SRD):** What was the total amount given?

**Shri. Santosh Dhamdhere:** Under 'Go Cashless,' approximately ₹641 crore turnover occurred during the last three-year tenure. In the re-cancellation, the amount that came to us shows a minus of ₹1 crore 64 lakh. We have consistently shown this in our balance sheet.

**Shri. D.S. Dhotre (CDAR):** I have a question for Mr. Nimbalkar. If we proceed under civil law, what would be the approximate court expense? Roughly how much would we need to pay?

**Advocate Shri. Vishal Nimbalkar:** "Approximately 2% as legal fees.

**Shri. D.S. Dhotre (CDAR):** Of what?

**Advocate Shri. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Of the claim amount.

**Shri. Yaduveer Singh (HLUD):** "Mr. Nimbalkar, what would your fees be?

**Shri. Prakash Patil (SRD):** What about the time period?

**Shri. Prakash Patil (SRD):** Mr. Nimbalkar, what would your fees be?

**Advocate Shri. Vishal Nimbalkar:** You should send a proposal. Gather two or three people who have followed up on this issue, filed complaints, and have knowledge about it how much money was involved, how the agreement was made. The General Body

should grant authority to them. Since the General Body has now stated that both decisions can be taken, you should give those powers to the committee and the management committee. They will give a proper response and, after approving the expenses, proceed with further action.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Sir has said approx. 2% of the total amount will be required, so approve that expense now.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare ;** The AGM has decided that both civil and Co-operative actions should be taken. For that, we will appoint a committee and give it authority.

**Shri. Prakash Patil (SRD):** Both civil and cooperative actions must be taken.

**Shri. Santosh Dhamdhare:** We are taking action on both matters, and for that we are now appointing a committee. At least grant authority to that committee.

**Shri. Prakash Patil (SRD):** Dhamdhare, this is the third year now.

**Shri. Girish Shenoy (Ex-Officio Chairman):** Patil Sir, why unnecessarily go down that path?

**Shri. Santosh Dhamdhare:** "Please listen. As the advocate has just stated, committees will be formed. At least grant authority to those committees—that five or six members from the house along with the Board of Directors' team together should approve whatever tender process takes place, or any matters related to the legal advisor. I request the house only this much—so that we can work on this issue on a fast track. Does everyone agree?"

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED):** My doubt: the work order expired on 07.10.2022 does any limitation period apply for filing?

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar :** No, you can file at any time.

**Mr. Manoj Wadekar (RED) :** Have we issued any notice to Go Cashless till now?

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Yes, a legal notice has been sent by the Board.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** All documents are open for everyone. We will proceed urgently. Let us move to the next item.

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** One minute due to negligence of the previous Board, the society has suffered loss. Action should be taken on that as well.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** Do you want to speak about TDS?

**Mr. D. S. Rajapure (DRHR):** Give assurance.

**Mr. Santosh Dhamdhare:** For both Career Junction and Go Cashless, we will conduct re audit. Give authority to the committee to approve proper actions and necessary expenses. Regarding recruitment, we again request Advocate Nimbalkar's guidance.

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar:** Same principle applies: consider the last three years and take these matters in re audit. Your legal/audit team will bring out issues such as errors in recruitment process and Go Cashless expenditure. Accordingly, re audit will happen, then Section 83 enquiry, and if found guilty, liability will be fixed under Section 88.

**Mr. Rajesh Kalke (CDM):** In the application process will missing applicant signatures etc. also be covered?

**Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar :** Everything will be covered.

Further Resolutions (Go Cashless & Career Junction)

**It was further resolved that to recover the amount of ₹1,64,11,098/ due from Go Cashless India Pvt. Ltd., two routes be adopted: either proceed through the Co-operative Court, or recover the amount by taking legal action against the previous Board of Directors.**

**This resolution was approved unanimously.**

**It was further resolved that for conducting recruitment process, M/s. Career Junction Placement 1, Vashi had been assigned work and an advance of ₹1,50,000/ had been paid legal action be taken to recover the said amount.**

**This resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Proposer: Mr. Vilas Ghorpade (FD)**

**Secunder: Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)**

**The resolutions were approved unanimously.**

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Take the last item and finish.

**Agenda No. 11: Condonation of Absence of Members**

**Annual General Meeting Resolution No. 11. It was resolved that the absence of those members who could not attend the 64th Annual General Meeting due to work obligations at their establishment be condoned. This resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Proposer: Mr. Nilesh Kamtekar (NRG Project)**

**Secunder: Mr. D. S. Dhotre (CDM)**

**The resolution was approved unanimously.**

**Mr. Ram Parab (UED):** This report there was so much commotion for this. How simple it could be how many photos are needed? This year it felt different. I request: next time print it simply and include only important photos. We are not opposing, but there is no need to over glamorize it.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** One minute many people may not know its importance. Who is from CDM here? People from CDM should understand it is an international level thing. It should come like this. Credit goes to the CDM people.

**Mr. Mukund Vairalkar (A&SED) :** Sir, we are not talking about the cover. We are talking about the “wedding album” type (overdone) report there has been a big controversy.

**Mr. Girish Shenai (Ex Officio President):** Okay, okay. Don't go to the cover, but appreciate the effort. The matters are completed. Now I announce the vote of thanks and declare the meeting concluded. Everyone should stand for the National Anthem.

**Mr. Hemant Koli (Chairman):** Heartfelt thanks to all honourable members present today; Ex Officio President Mr. Girish Shenai; Vice President; CSO Mr. V. T. Pawar; DCSO Mr. Shriram and security staff; convention sound system staff; Chartered Accountant Mr. Randive; Co-operative expert Mr. Sandeep Patil; Advocate Mr. Vishal Nimbalkar; Internal Auditor Mr. Satish, and all others. I declare today's meeting concluded.

**Mr. Bahubali Chougule (Hon. Secretary):** I request everyone to stand for the National Anthem. Thank you very much to all members.